



**Jesuit Centre  
for  
Theological Reflection**  
*"Promoting Faith and Justice"*

**P. O. BOX 37774  
LUSAKA - ZAMBIA**

**LUWISHA HOUSE  
5880 GREAT EAST ROAD**

**Tel.: +260-211-290410**

**Fax: +260-211-290759**

**E-mail:  
jctr@jesuits.org.zm**

**Website:  
www.jctr.org.zm**

**ISSN 1990-4479**

|  |    |
|--|----|
| LETTER FROM THE EDITOR.....  | 2  |
| <i>CARITAS IN VERITATE – A ZAMBIAN PERSPECTIVE.....</i><br><i>Joe Komakoma</i>                     | 3  |
| CHRIST WITH A ZAMBIAN FACE.....<br><i>Chishala Francis Chisembe, S.J.</i>                          | 5  |
| CATHOLIC FORMATION AND THE SECOND AFRICAN SYNOD.....<br><i>Tom Kearney, CFC</i>                    | 8  |
| ARE WE WINNING THE BATTLE AGAINST HIV AND AIDS WITH<br>ARVS?.....<br><i>Marie O'Brien, FMSA</i>    | 10 |
| THE MOVEMENT FOR HIV PREVENTION.....<br><i>Michael J. Kelly, S.J.</i>                              | 12 |
| TIME TO FIGHT THE GOOD FIGHT OF CORRUPTION EFFECTIVELY ..<br><i>Trevor Simumba</i>                 | 17 |
| THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECENT G8 DISCUSSIONS FOR ZAMBIA<br><i>Humphrey Mulemba Jr.</i>            | 19 |
| ROMANTICISING POVERTY: IS POVERTY A NEW WORLD<br>BUSINESS?.....<br><i>Dominic Liche</i>            | 22 |
| DR. MOYO'S PROPOSAL TO ABOLISH DEVELOPMENT AID.....<br><i>Maarten de Zeeuw and Mwangala Mubita</i> | 26 |
| LETTER TO THE EDITOR.....  | 30 |
| THE JCTR <i>BASIC NEEDS BASKET</i> .....   | 31 |
| THE JCTR UPDATE: PEOPLE AND ACTIVITIES .....   | 32 |

True development can only be achieved through freedom and justice where each society is given space and respect to set its own priorities for national development. (From "Caritas in Veritate - A Zambian Perspective," P.3)

# LETTER FROM THE EDITOR

*Dear Readers,*

The second quarter of 2009 was an interesting one but also an annoying one. Debates on the global financial crisis and development aid occupied most of the second quarter in Zambia. The quarter was interesting because of development debates, but annoying in that Government wasn't very responsive to the challenges of strikes, misappropriation of public funds, and questions on the nature of the National Constitutional Conference (NCC). Actually a National Indaba (5-6 April) on the global financial crisis was organised by the Zambian Government. To most Zambians' surprise, there was no follow up and we are yet to see a report of the Indaba. Dambisa Moyo's book *Dead Aid* aroused a lot of debate with her thesis that aid has not brought any development to Africa but underdevelopment, corruption and dictatorial states and that aid should be stopped in five years. Dambisa even came to Zambia (part of her global marathon as a celebrity on her book) and discussed aid with some Zambian economists and others including our JCTR staffer Humphrey Mulemba.

Despite the very good arguments of Humphrey that Dambisa's arguments were either faulty or misplaced in the aid debate, Dambisa arrogantly upheld her position and this was the same in all the places she global trotted where she closed the debate by not even seeing the good arguments of others. At the same time that Dambisa published her book, Peter Singer, a much more sober writer, published a book *The Life you Can Save*. In Singer's book, a much sharper reason that people should be moved to give aid is given, namely that it is just human to help others when they are suffering or "drowning." By just giving a small percentage of one's earnings (5%), we could actually end world poverty.

In the second quarter, we witnessed strikes by health workers, school teachers and University of Zambia (UNZA) lecturers demanding salary increases and in some cases these were actually promised. The teachers and health workers were demanding about 30% salary increment. After a long time of not working (striking), they were only awarded 15% (even when Government had only budgeted for a decent 11% increment in the year). The University of Zambia lecturers were much more unfortunate for they were only assured of 3% increment (although they have refused to accept this).

The biggest problem in Zambia with strikes (that often are a cause of death to a good number of Zambians especially in the health sector) is that Government often does not respond in time to the needs of the people. Even when Government knows exactly what they will do, they will wait until valuable time is lost, patients unnecessarily die, and students lose school time, for them to respond. One of the characteristics of good governance is "responsiveness" (responding to people's needs) Our Government is failing on this principle because when all the strikes were happening, our leaders were busy enjoying themselves on international visits and lobbying for their "contractual" mid-term gratuities (over US\$80, 000 per person). The Church was key in speaking out against Government's non-responsiveness in their statements and letters but got only scorns and the usual bad advice that the Church should keep to the pulpits and not be involved in public life.

The constitution making process through the National Constitutional Conference (NCC) has continued to be stalled because of personal and political interests. Some of the recommendations of Zambians aired through the Mung'omba Constitution Review Commission (CRC) were rejected by the NCC or pushed to a national referendum. Catholic Bishops and others have several times called for the disbandment of this NCC for it is non-viable and going contrary to the aspirations and desires of Zambians. But the NCC continues to sit indefinitely, at great expense to us tax payers. Despite the JCTR having contributed to the NCC debates by giving very objective and good papers on debt management and the need for economic, social and cultural rights, we cannot but agree more with the Catholic Bishops that the NCC is becoming non-viable if their sittings are going on indefinitely (with no clear timetable) and if the NCC is going against the recommendations of Zambian citizens voiced in the Mung'omba CRC.

Partnering with the British based Catholic Agency for Development (CAFOD) on the Action for Better Governance (ABG) programme, the JCTR has undertaken a study on the communications and statements of the Catholic Bishops from 2007 to date on governance issues. We have found that despite the good recommendations and advice from the Church, no real action is taken by Government and this is worrying in Zambia's governance.

October 2009 will see the Second African Synod meeting in Rome. Preparations on the Synod continue and JCTR has contributed to this process, through a pre-synod book and by having our Director, Peter Henriot, being one of the advisors to the AMECEA Bishops at the Synod.

Articles in this *Bulletin* are heavily theological touching on Synod issues, and the new Pope's encyclical and its relevance to the Zambian situation. Other articles deal with the issue of aid and the G20 commitments, HIV and AIDS, poverty and other social justice issues. We encourage you our readers to continue contributing to these issues through your comments, letters and articles.

*Dominic Liche, Editor*

# CARITAS IN VERITATE – A ZAMBIAN PERSPECTIVE

In June 2009, Pope Benedict XVI published a powerful encyclical *Charity in Truth* that addresses many social, economic, and political issues with a Church social teaching eye. Fr. Joe Komakoma, the Secretary General of the Zambia Episcopal Conference (ZEC), contextualises the message of the encyclical to Zambia's development challenges.

## CONTEXT OF ZAMBIA

Recently, Zambia experienced a month long strike by civil servants, particularly teachers and health workers. The main contention by health workers was the salary package and other working conditions. Government was not prepared to go beyond a 15% increment when the civil servants wanted a 25% increment and improvement in some key allowances.

One felt sorry for the Government since they had only budgeted for a maximum increment of 11%. The fear by Government was that going beyond that figure would make them break one of the conditionalities imposed by the International Financial Institutions (the IMF and the World Bank) that governments who seek their help should not spend more than 8% of the GDP for personal emoluments.

The harsh reality here is that the Government of the Republic of Zambia does not have the freedom to sit with its own citizens to decide a salary package that meets the cost of living. Needless to say, civil servants in Zambia are poorly paid. Their salaries barely meet the basic needs basket of about US\$400 per month. This has caused an exodus from the sector leaving the few teachers and nurses on Government payroll overworked.

This lack of sovereignty by our government to pay decent wages to its workers led to the month long strike with disastrous consequences. It meant that the majority of Zambians (about 70%) who live on a dollar or less per day had no access to healthcare during this period. They could not afford the cost of private healthcare. Many avoidable deaths were reported as a result. We also had such heart rending reports like the woman who gave birth on the streets as her family shuttled her from one Government health centre to the next in the hope of finding one with minimal services. That the child was still born in the process was inevitable!

## CHARITY IN TRUTH

This scenario, for me, accentuates the issues the Pope has wonderfully addressed in his new and powerful Encyclical - *Caritas in Veritate*, or *Charity*

*in Truth*. The Zambian situation is a case in point in what is deficient about the current world economic order. It shows that the so-called efforts of trying to help poor countries come out of poverty and underdevelopment, many times end up increasing the poverty cycle. It also raises fundamental problem of the international development agenda where the rich and powerful countries call the shots and the poor countries live the consequences of those decisions.

True development can only be achieved through freedom and justice where each society is given space and respect to set its own priorities for national development. We cannot leave that to the whims of the IMF and the World Bank. Unfortunately, this is what is obtaining at the moment.

We are living in a world where the profit motive is paramount and not the proper development of all peoples. We do not seem to care about the means through which this profit motive is achieved, even when poor countries like Zambia are squeezed so that rich countries can continue to prosper. It is a world in which financial speculation and unregulated exploitation of the earth's resources become acceptable.

Zambia has faced the brunt of such behaviour in the recent past. It is no secret that the IMF and World Bank arm twisted our Government to allow international mining companies to come and exploit Zambia's renowned copper at great profits to the

---

**True development can only be achieved through freedom and justice where each society is given space and respect to set its own priorities for national development.**

---

investors and minimal benefit to the country. The IMF sponsored agreements with these mining companies allowed then to have minimal local investment, low taxation, and unencumbered externalisation of profits. When the current economic crisis hit, a good number of those companies were quick to close shop, leaving behind not only massive numbers of unemployed miners, but also serious environmental degradation. This is a great cost now in Zambia's lap.

One cannot therefore but agree with the Pope that we have let human greed and self centeredness permeate our social relations to the detriment of the common good. We have let the major players in the economic and financial fields behave outside the ethical sphere in the name of wealth creation and material progress. We have let the international institutions serve mainly the interests of the rich and powerful countries.

Pope Benedict XVI ties up all these issues beautifully in his new encyclical. He proposes a whole series of values and principles that can truly bring about the development that all societies seek, if heeded. I also see the Encyclical as a clarion call around which those of us from poor countries like Zambia can rally to vigorously demand the necessary reforms that will allow us to chart our own development destinies as the situation on the ground requires.

I see the following issues, from the Encyclical, as really pertinent for this to happen.

### **THE DIGNITY AND EQUALITY OF ALL**

The whole world has been hit by the current economic crisis and yet when it came to seriously sitting down to look for solutions, there was only room at the table for the privileged and self selected few – the G20 who met in London, this past April 2009.

That the hardest hit by the economic crisis are poor countries like Zambia was not good enough for them to have a place at the table. Yet Zambia and other poor countries will for years to come suffer the consequences of those decisions.

The Pope makes it clear that we are all equal in human dignity as individuals, states, or institutions. The principles of Subsidiarity and Solidarity are therefore pertinent in enhancing the sense of mutual respect.

Those are the principles that would allow the world society to ensure that all voices are heard, regardless of their social status, especially in the face of an international crisis like the current one.

### **THE PRINCIPLE OF THE COMMON GOOD**

Without the common good as its ultimate end, the current economic order risks destroying wealth it purports to create and increase poverty. Zambia is a case in point as I have pointed out above. Without taking into account the necessity of fair distribution of the created wealth it makes it inevitable that the gap between the rich and poor will continue to widen.

Furthermore, interests of countries like Zambia must be taken seriously if these countries are to see the development they seek come about. It is actually in the interests of rich countries to realise that they will never, for instance, succeed to stem the flow of immigrants into their countries if some countries remain desperately poor.

### **CALL TO ACTION**

The Pope calls for far reaching reforms and changes in the manner we co-exist as a global human society. It is hard to disagree with him that a new world political authority is desperately needed that will be able to manage the global economy, guarantee the protection of the environment, regulate migration, bring about food security and peace, and revive economies hit by the current economic crisis.

This can only happen if there is political will and commitment at all levels, at individual, national and international levels. Unless we act, nothing will change. This is where we come in as Christians. We are the ones to champion this cause.

We need to stand in solidarity from the North and South doing what is necessary in our societies. The main challenge for those of us from poor countries is to push our governments to better democratic

---

**Without the common good as its ultimate end, the current economic order risks destroying wealth it purports to create and increase poverty.**

---

governance which will then give us a solid platform to ask for what is just from the international community. Those from the rich countries are in the forefront to impress upon their governments to heed the Pope's call for these necessary reforms since it is the rich countries that control the international system.

With the means of social communication available, thanks to globalisation, we have the basis we need to start a massive global campaign.

The new Encyclical comes as a key document for advocacy that must not be allowed to lie unused. It has come as a timely advocacy tool with very clear and specific standpoints for the required changes. These are changes that are necessary to bring about authentic human development to peoples all over the world, especially poor countries like Zambia.

*Fr. Joe Komakoma  
Zambia Episcopal Conference  
Lusaka, Zambia*

# JESUS CHRIST WITH A ZAMBIAN FACE

Inculturation of Christianity in Africa has been central in the last three decades and most especially since the First African Synod, in the early 1990s. Key to inculturation is redefining the relevance of Jesus Christ to the different cultures. Chishala Francis Chisembe, a Jesuit theology student, develops a Christology of the Zambian context using the methodology of contemporary theologian, Peter Phan.

Though Phan formulates a Christology of Asia prompted by Jesus' question "Who do you say that I am?", the actual problem he addresses is more anchored on Choan-Seng Song's (Theological Studies 57, 1996: 417) Christology. Song's Christology puts emphasis not on the identity of Christ but on "whom Christ identifies with" in the Asian context. In trying to formulate a Zambian Christology I would suppose a Zambian theologian would, like Song, address the question "Whom does Christ identify with in the Zambian context?" It is by responding to this question that it can be said a Zambian theologian has successfully defined Christ's identity. Phan argues that by taking this approach will the Christology being formulated make sense to the people in that given context. This is a Christology from below that has its praxis that is historical and constructed on the socio-economic, political and

---

**Theology and in particular a Christology that is relevant to a people should be one that finds resonance in the socio-economic, political, cultural and religious dimensions of their daily existence.**

---

anthropological dimensions or experience of a given society. This is the same type of Christology advocated by Takatso Mofokeng in his article, "Hermeneutical Explorations for Black Christology" (Parkee J, 1992). Mofokeng argues that:

A relevant Christology arises, as we observed in the history of Christology, during moments of cleavages and cracks in the socio-economic, cultural and religious dimensions of social formations. It emerged at times when it is abundantly clear to all committed followers of the messiah from Nazareth, those who are eager to be at the cutting edge of world and human history, that their inherited theology which they held very dearly and protected very jealously against all ideological assaults is no longer able to explain events around them, nor to support their faith or even to stimulate hope beyond the cleavages and cracks in society and church (1992: 85).

What can be deduced from Mofokeng's argument is that a Theology and in particular a Christology that is relevant to a people should be one that finds resonance in the socio-economic, political, cultural

and religious dimensions of their daily existence. Their practising of religious beliefs should be in touch with what they crave for, what defines them and what moves them or make them tick as a people. When their Christology emerges to be out of sync with issues that worry them, challenges that they face, then such a Christology is impotent, it has become like salt that has lost its saltiness. A Christology that emphasises the vertical dimension alone at the expense of the horizontal dimension gets relegated to oblivion. It's a pie in the sky; it doesn't fly. Theology and Christology in particular should take both a vertical and horizontal dimension. This task is beyond inculturation where, for instance, we pick elements of culture and tradition and infuse them into our faith. Sometimes such an approach might still appear remote from the people's realities. You might include the cultural or traditional element in the Christian practice yet that is not what the immediate milieu is about. Such a traditional element in the urban young might revoke memories of elements in the remote past that have no relevance to the present. In our case we are talking of a Christology that is formulated from the Zambian context for it to be meaningful and relevant to the Zambian milieu. This will be the approach that I will try to synthesise in developing a Christology of Jesus Christ with a Zambian face.

## PHAN'S ASSESSMENT OF ASIA

Phan formulates a dualistic Christology of Asia by identifying the third-worldliness of Asia and also its religiosity. This dualistic Christology finds a meeting point in the praxis of liberation. The third worldliness has the ramifications of poverty, unemployment, crime, illiteracy, corruption which are brought about due to poor governance. Hence, Jesus Christ is identified with the suffering woman struggling with her children in the ghettos of Mumbai or Hong Kong, a homeless boy in Calcutta and a labourer in the factories of China.

By identifying Christ with the suffering masses, Phan advocates for a liberation theology that uplifts the livelihood of the suffering masses. The religiosity character of Asia is so unique to this part of the world. Bringing Christianity to this part of the world did not introduce religiosity to it. Therefore, Phan argues that for Christianity to be relevant to Asia it has to tap into the religious experience already in existence in this



part of the world. He proposes that Jesus Christ has to be identified with the Buddhist monk's way of life that opts for a spirituality that liberates the spirit from the materialistic world. This simplicity of life acts as a vehicle of fighting the social injustices that lead the masses to live in entrenched poverty. The Buddhist monk's life becomes a force that propels social change. Therefore, the religiosity of Asia is linked in some sense to the third-worldliness in terms of the praxis of liberation.

The Asian context is very different from that of Africa in the sense that the histories of these two continents are different, though both share a common element of colonialism. In this sense it can be said that formulating a Christology of Zambia would be very different to the project of Phan. This essay will attempt at least to utilise the methodology of Phan to formulate a Christology of Zambia. It must be stated here that Phan's Christology is balanced in the sense that it has both a positive aspect as identified in the religiosity dimension and a negative aspect in the sense of third-worldliness. However, Mofokeng's articulation of a Black theology somehow highlights the darkest part of history, that of apartheid. We can not run away from this reality as it is part of history. In formulating a Christology of Zambia it might seem unfortunate to highlight only the negative aspects. Jesus himself identified with the downtrodden and the underprivileged.

In responding to the question whom does Jesus Christ identify with in the Zambian situation, I see two distinct responses. Firstly, in the socio-economic and political dimension, I see Jesus Christ identifying himself with people who have become destitute due to mass retrenchments of the labour force. Secondly, in the socio-cultural and spiritual dimension, I see Jesus Christ identifying himself with people afflicted by disease such as HIV and AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis. This dimension, in the traditional setting, brings suspicion of witchcraft. I am going to contextualise the above assumptions and show that both dimensions converge in a theology that constructs the praxis of liberation.

## THE ZAMBIAN CONTEXT

Zambia is one of the poorest nations in the world. With a population of about only 12 million; two thirds (64%) of its people live below the poverty line of \$1 per day. Zambia's economy is heavily dependent on copper. For over a decade now copper prices have fluctuated on the world market. With the ushering in of democracy in Zambia with liberal economic tendencies in the early 1990's most of the mines were privatised leading to a loss of jobs by thousands of employees. Most Zambians were not able to invest in mining because they lacked capital to do so. This meant that the Government had to woo foreign investors to come and invest in the mining sector. Few employees were retained by the

new investors, causing doom to thousands who depended on the mines to earn their livelihood. One of the incentives the Zambian Government had put in place to do this was to exempt foreign investors in the mining sector from paying tax for the first ten years of operation. To evade tax most foreign investors would fold up after the first ten years, causing thousands of employees to be laid off. The fact that copper prices were not doing well on the world market meant that foreign investors were hesitant to come and invest in Zambia.

The shutting down of some mines (like the Luanshya Copper Mines) had a ripple effect on other industries that were dependant on the mines either as suppliers of services and materials or receivers of mining products. For instance, some schools, hospitals and sports clubs that were run by the mines also got affected and were privatised. The closure of some of these industries led to mass retrenchments of the labour force. This meant unemployment to many Zambians living along the line of rail. As mining was the biggest earner of national income for the Government followed by the tax collected from

---

### The socio-economic and political dimensions of the Zambian situation call for a theology that constructs the praxis of liberation.

---

the labour force, it meant that, that revenue was no longer available. The Government stopped recruiting graduating teachers, doctors, nurses and so forth, partly because of lack of capacity and partly because of the conditionalities of the International Financial Institutions. The ripple effect of the collapse of the mining sector on other industries and the civil service was so enormous that people in the cities, who before enjoyed many services provided by the Government, were now destitute. Unemployment had become rampant as people were struggling to engage in small businesses to make ends meet.

## ZAMBIAN CHRISTOLOGY

All in all, the scenario described above of the problems in the mining sector and its negative effects on the labour force indicate that many Zambians had become unemployed and destitute. In formulating a Christology that is relevant to the Zambian context, this stark reality of poverty and unemployment has to be borne in mind. Jesus Christ has to identify himself with the destitute living along the line of rail and elsewhere who struggle to find ways of surviving and make ends meet. This is the first praxis of formulating a Christology with Jesus Christ who has a Zambian face. The socio-economic and political dimensions of the Zambian situation call for a theology that constructs the praxis of liberation.

In the socio-cultural and spiritual dimension the Zambian context brings to light the issue of sickness and the suspicions that issues from it. Zambia as a developing nation has not been spared by the scourge of HIV and AIDS. About 15% of the population is infected and a larger number is affected by the pandemic. The sad reality is that most of those infected are in the productive age group, i.e., 15 – 49 years, hence depriving many families of bread winners. The issue of HIV and AIDS requires concerted effort in order to be mitigated. The issues of stigma, prevention, treatment are very cardinal in addressing the scourge. How do the Zambian masses respond to the issue of HIV and AIDS? There are many levels at which this question can be addressed. There is the level of advocacy, care and research. In the context of theology, a faith based response is offered in terms of advocacy and care. One can talk of proper treatment and increased funding for treatment, care and research. At care level you can talk of home based care carried out by faith based communities and civil communities.

Malaria and tuberculosis (TB) are the highest killers of people in Zambia, even exceeding that of HIV and AIDS. Here also there is the issue of funding and having good health facilities that are able to provide adequate health care to the already

---

**Jesus Christ needs to identify himself with a poor boy in Lukulu dying of malaria because the nearest health centre has neither personnel nor facilities for treating the disease.**

---

impoverished masses. At the core of providing good health facilities is the issue of governance. How committed is the Zambian Government to providing health services to its poor communities? This is a very big problem because the Government has wrong priorities. Every year when the Minister of Finance presents the budget to parliament, the health issue does not surface as priority. For instance, the annual budgetary allocation for defence and security far exceeds that of health -- even when we know that Zambia is a peaceful nation and unlikely to go to war at any time!

### **CHRISTOLOGY OF LIBERATION**

This scenario of health presents a case where many Zambians are left to die in remote areas due to lack of medication or better medical facilities. Even when medication is available people are too poor to have nutritious diets that would enhance speedy recovery in case of TB treatment. It is this scenario that provides grounds for formulating a Christology of liberation. Because people are too poor and the country has poor medical facilities, when faced with issues of HIV and AIDS, Malaria and TB, people turn

to apportioning blame on witchcraft. In times of such sicknesses people seek the help of witch doctors instead of conventional medicine. Jesus Christ needs to identify himself with a person languishing in the remote parts of Zambia with HIV and AIDS. Jesus Christ ought to identify himself with a poor woman in Shangombo ailing with TB and at the same time unable to have good nutrition when on medication. Jesus Christ needs to identify himself with a poor boy in Lukulu dying of malaria because the nearest health centre has neither personnel nor facilities for treating the disease.

The question of governance comes in here because medical personnel sometimes refuse to go and serve in remote parts of the country and also that their services are not well remunerated. Another issue is that the Government does not see health as a priority. A theological response that is faith based is exemplified by mission hospitals in remote areas like Katete. It is also exemplified by the home based care projects that are found in most parts of the country as a response to the mitigation of HIV and AIDS and TB.

In conclusion, the best response in which African Christologies can be contextualised is when it deals with the concrete situations of a people. In the case of Zambia we are talking about the pertinent issues such as poverty, unemployment and disease. The Zambian Government should be committed in providing employment, health care and address issues of poverty. This commitment should be seen even constitutionally by having economic, social and cultural rights in the new Bill of Rights. Other institutions such as faith-based organisations and civil society are called to be partners in providing assistance in these areas. It is in this area that a theology of liberation is needed to speak on behalf of the afflicted, the unemployed and the poor. It needs to fight the social injustice that creates a pyramid in the socio-economic strata with a fraction living in immoral opulence, a sizeable number surviving in the middle-class and a legion wallowing in abject penury. This reality is reflected when we juxtapose a well fledged corrupt minister or Member of Parliament driving a limousine and a hungry security guard riding a bicycle to work. A theology built on the praxis of liberation will provide hope for the other Christ living or identified with the jobless, the hapless and the ailing.

A Zambian Christology makes Jesus Christ have a Zambian face. In doing so, using Phan's example, one looks at the socio-economic, political, socio-cultural, and spiritual dimensions. Jesus Christ needs to be contextualised to these dimensions in order to create ground for the praxis of liberation.

*Chishala Francis Chisembe, S.J.  
Hekima College  
Nairobi, Kenya*

# CATHOLIC FORMATION AND THE SECOND AFRICA SYNOD

*This year from 04 to 25 October, African Bishops, advisors and others will be gathering in Rome for the Second Special Assembly of African Synod of Bishops (popularly known as the Second African Synod) discussing Church and social issues under the theme, "The Church in Africa at the Service of Reconciliation, Justice and Peace: 'You are the salt of the earth .... You are the light of the world' (Matthew 5:13-15)". In the first quarter Bulletin of 2009, Pete Henriot raised key issues of the Synod and suggested ways of participation by Christians. Brother Tom Kearney furthers this contribution by stressing the need for formation.*

In his article "Moving to the Second Africa Synod", Fr Henriot S.J. noted that the AMECEA Bishops had agreed to some priority areas for discussion at the Second Africa Synod. These included: Peace and Conflict Resolution, Poverty, Inculturation, Ecology, Political Governance, Self-reliance, and Formation. He also concluded that we, the people of Africa, need to be involved actively in processes leading up to the Second Synod, as well as in following up the outcomes. We need to begin to consider the agenda items and participate in their consideration in various areas of discussion.

One of these key areas is that of Catholic Formation – formation of all members of the Church Community. Recently a Christian with many years experience in Africa made the comment that Christianity in Africa is "a mile wide and but an inch deep." Unfortunately, there may be some truth in this statement. Too often have we seen that so many of our Catholic leaders, both clerical and lay, have failed to live by their Catholic values, in fact have acted contrary to Catholic values, e.g., Catholic killing Catholic in the name of tribalism; Catholic deliberately taking advantage of other Catholics in the name of power and financial advantage; Catholic deliberately destroying creation, especially in an illegal way to advantage himself, e.g., land grabbing. These are only a few examples of our failure to live the call of the gospel. How well have we been educated and formed in our faith? Have we integrated the teachings of Jesus into our way of living?

The issue of Formation would cover all members of the Church: Clergy, religious brothers and sisters, and the laity. At all levels, we need to continue to develop our understanding of our faith and how it relates to our living our spiritual lives. It is not good enough to say that I studied theology when I was in formation. That may have been forty years ago. I need to have integrated this into my way of living.

There is a requirement for all of us, especially the leaders in our Church Community, to continue to form ourselves in the developments that have occurred in the thinking and teaching about our faith and how we

practice it. If priorities were to be given, maybe it should be to the formation of the priests, the religious sisters and brothers, and the leaders of the Small Christian Communities, who in turn need to pass on the message to other members of the Church.

## IDENTITY OF CHURCH

There is a need for us, as Church, to recognise that we, too, are a part of the society and the world around us. We have, in fact, contributed to the lack of reconciliation in our world, mostly by not taking a lead when it was required of us. We do not seem to have had the courage to face our misdeeds of the

---

**Too often have we seen that so many of our Catholic Leaders, both clerical and lay, have failed to live by their Catholic values, in fact have acted contrary to Catholic values.**

---

past. We must be prepared to look at the structures within our Church, which may be part of the problem. Have we alienated our people because we do not consult among the members of our parishes and missions? Do we invite parishioners to be part of decision making through various committees and councils? We need to look in a discerning way at the Church practices, which may be working against reconciliation.

These questions would seem to call us to look again at our model of Church, our way of thinking about the Church, our understanding of what Evangelisation means, our ability to integrate our way of living with the message of Christ's teachings and their application in our African context.

## ISSUES OF CONCERN

Some of the issues of concern include among others:

- the role and practice of authority in our Church ministries;



- the centralisation of power within the Church structures;
- the lack of reconciliation within the Church;
- the evidence of tribalism within the Church;
- the evidence of failure to address grievances within the Church community;
- the lack of just wages for Church employees,
- the role of women in the Church;
- the examples of compromise between Church and Politics;
- the fear of taking a prophetic stance within the Church;
- the mutual suspicion between members of the Church community;
- the lack of making our Church African in its celebrations;
- the lack of desire to engage in theological discussion on Marriage;
- the lack of desire to engage in theological discussion on the celebration of Eucharist.

### **LACK OF INTEGRATION**

The fact that our commitment to our faith and the practice of its values does not seem to have much depth is worrying. Most of us do not seem to have personalised our faith and integrated it into our lives. Where have we failed in our proclamation of the gospel, our explanation of it? Where have we failed our people? These are challenges facing all ministers of the gospel – priests, religious brothers and sisters, as well as the SCC leaders. Perhaps a reminder of the universal call of baptism as a call to holiness and membership of a Church community built on mutual acceptance and respect is a much needed starting point.

There is a call for further evangelisation of the peoples. When we talk of the Church, what model of Church are we talking about? Is it that of the People of God, the Family of God as the first Africa Synod left us? This is where all of us come together to listen to Jesus, to consider his lessons to us, and the message he has about the relationship that God wishes to have with each of us. This does not depend on our tribal affiliation, our personal income or status in society. It is a personal call to follow Jesus, to take his teachings and to act on them, to make his values our own values, and to support each other by our active membership of the Church community.

The message of the first African Synod has been slow to enter into the lives of our African Catholics. The message has not been preached much because many, maybe most of our preachers are not familiar with the outcomes. It has not often been part of the homilies preached to our Catholic people. Maybe the formation of our priests needs to be the first priority.

Unless they have integrated the message, we cannot really expect that they will pass on the message to the ordinary parishioner. Surely, there is a case for us to look again at what we teach in our catechetics classes, and what is presented to all our people to nourish and deepen their faith life.

### **PRAYING COMMUNITIES**

Perhaps we need to consider the strategies to build up “praying communities” rather than communities of people who say prayers and then live without thinking about what they prayed about. We are mindful that through prayer comes reconciliation. This is where the attitudes we take to prayer are the attitudes we live by in our dealings with our family members and our neighbours. We are also mindful that at the heart of our Catholic spiritual life is participation in the Sacraments. We must look again at how we can relate our African way of life with that of Jesus’ teachings. We need to develop a theology of the Eucharist, which respects the social reality in which our people live. This is our call to a compassionate presence for our people. We need to develop a service in ministry towards Marriage and Family Life, as well as helping people to personalise their faith through Spiritual Retreats and Days of Recollection.

The challenge to all Christians is to look again at the spirituality of engagement with the creation and the world rather than a separation from the world. We cannot live a private individualistic devotional life, and not be involved with the injustice being inflicted on our neighbour in many different forms. We can never be a “Light to the World” unless we integrate the values of Jesus and his teachings into all aspects of our lives. We can no longer subscribe to individualism but to the Christian community and the responsibilities it requires us to assume. We can no longer subscribe to a life of devotions and private prayer and separation from the world, but to an engagement with the justice issues of the world around us. We can no longer comfortably subscribe to conformism but to the challenge of prophetic encounters with the world.

This requires significant changes for our leaders, our pastors, our catechists and our people. Such will not happen unless we are committed to ongoing formation at all levels of our Church community from our latest catechumen to the Bishop. It is both our personal and communal responsibility to keep ourselves informed of the developments in the teachings and theologies within our community.

*Tom Kearney CFC  
International Spirituality Centre  
Chelstone, Lusaka*

# ARE WE WINNING THE BATTLE AGAINST HIV AND AIDS WITH ARVS?

*Since the HIV and AIDS pandemic began mostly in the 1980s, many strategies have been used to halt the spread of the pandemic. HIV and AIDS has continued to affect the health of individuals and families but most sadly, it has affected development especially in sub-Saharan Africa. Sister Marie O'Brien argues that despite anti-retroviral treatment providing relief, more needs to be done in prevention, knowledge of one's status, education, and change of cultural attitudes.*

My answer to the above question is "NO". I believe we are not winning the battle against AIDS with ARVs. As one who has been involved in Community Home Based Care Programmes for HIV and AIDS clients since 1993 I have witnessed remarkable changes in that period.

First of all, it is right that we acknowledge some of the wonderful benefits of ARV's such as:

- The dramatic improvement in the quality of life for so many HIV positive people;
- The extended life span, especially of mothers, which will limit the number of orphans without a mother;
- The contribution to the breakdown of stigma.

There are many reasons to the question of whether we are winning the battle against HIV and AIDS, but let me mention three: (1) Attitudes to HIV and AIDS, (2) high risk behaviour, and (3) increase in number of HIV babies and children

## ATTITUDES TO HIV AND AIDS

In the early days, it was heartbreaking to see the terrible suffering of so many. Our patients had so many opportunistic infections, one after another – chronic diarrhoea, herpes zoster, rashes, fungal infections etc. Life was a misery. Funerals were the order of the day.

In 2004 we were part of a pilot scheme set up by the Archdiocese of Lusaka to dispense ARVs and within a short time there was a remarkable

**Many people do not want to know their status, and only go for VCT when they are sick. They may be very active sexually and have concurrent partners, increasing the risk of further spreading HIV and even re-infection.**

improvement in the health of our clients. At that time, there was a certain fear of getting this cruel disease and posters and advertisements showed skeletal figures, skulls and cross bones, which in some way

acted as a deterrent and made people more aware of the danger of acquiring the virus.

Today, thanks to the introduction of ARVs, what do we see in our posters? Very attractive, healthy looking young men and women, admitting their status so that they can live positively with the virus, knowing that ARVs will be available and they are even free. ARVs have removed that fear and have led to more people engaging in high risk behaviour knowing that there is some treatment.

People on ARVs now look very healthy and may be symptom free, but they carry the virus and can spread the disease. Before the advent of ARVs people had all the signs and were not so free to move around. Many people do not want to know their status, and only go for VCT when they are sick. They may be very active sexually and many have concurrent partners which increases the risk of further spread, and even re-infection. An example is of one single HIV-positive mother with twins who, when asked if the father would support the children, replied "How can he because his wife delivered twins the same week as I did?"

## INCREASE OF HIV BABIES AND CHILDREN

In our programme (Ng'ombe Community Home-based Care) we have regular support meetings for those on ARVs and these are well attended and enjoyed as clients challenge and support each other. I noticed then that these support meetings were becoming Marriage Bureaux as men and women became friends. Now our support groups resemble child welfare clinics. At a meeting of 30 to 40 clients there can be 10 to 15 small babies. At present in our programme we have 350 clients, and the majority are on ARVs.

Sad to say out of the 350 clients we have 77 children from small babies to teenagers. Many of these babies have been supplied with infant formula as the mothers were advised not to breastfeed. Some of the babies are positive because the mother could not afford to go to the clinic or hospital for delivery and so the baby was deprived of preventive

treatment. Neviriprime was the drug used but not always effective so now WHO has stopped this and recommend Zidovudine. Another new development is that babies can be found positive at 6 weeks through the use of the PCR test so babies as young as 8 weeks are now being given ARV suspension. Mothers are encouraged to breastfeed as so many cannot afford infant formula, and babies are suffering from malnutrition and are given all kinds of things. I have seen small babies being given maheu, and black tea.

I would like to share a few stories about these children. One day I was visiting a family and I asked the grandmother to show me the actual bottles of ARV suspension that she was giving the small child; she produced 7 bottles, 6 of them unopened. It was obvious that the poor old lady did not understand the correct dosages.

Another child who is actually 14 years but due to stunted growth looks like 9 years of age has been moved around among various relations. One evening his aunt had him working hard and at one point he refused to do any more chores, as he felt sick. The aunt told him then to get out. So he did get out and was found wandering and ended up at the police station while we were contacted. We found that he was not being given his ARVs and had some nasty boils. His uncle was asked to report to the police station and admitted that the child was being neglected. Later I visited my little friend and found he was not in school due to his clothes being unwashed and he had no shoes on him that cold morning because they were broken. We appreciate that the extended families are being overstretched but it is sad to see small children on ARVs suffering like this.

So ARVs is giving us a new generation of very small children who will be on ARVs for life but will not survive unless they receive better nutrition and loving care.

### **WHAT CAN WE DO?**

We have all heard of ABC = abstinence, faithfulness and condoms. But let me mention a few other things we can do.

If we are to win this battle it calls for a concerted effort by everyone, men, women, youths, Governments, NGOs and Faith Based Organizations.

A change of attitude and behaviour is needed as we encourage more people to know their status and to change their life styles. Men should be encouraged to engage in positive male behaviour. Most men only go for VCT when they are sick and often it is then too late.

Cultural values – I am told that women are more respected when they have a man! The status of

widows and single women need to be appreciated and we need to promote women's economic security and empowerment.

I share a few examples – a divorced woman who is now pregnant, welcomed back her husband while he is living with another woman. Another case of a separated husband who when he became very ill with TB and AIDS came back to be nursed by his former wife and then gives her a child before he disappears again.

I see many examples of male domination with regard to even the taking of ARVs – some women who were tested at the ante natal clinic are afraid to disclose their status to their husband who will blame them for bringing AIDS into the home. There is much abuse of women. Example – I found a woman who was in great pain, with cracked ribs having been beaten by the husband. Two weeks later I visited the same woman and asked what was happening. She told me the husband had beaten her again and she went to the police – the husband spent one night in the cells and the police opened a docket. When the in-laws arrived they told the young woman to drop the case and she agreed. Women need to know their rights!

### **CHANGE OF BEHAVIOUR**

Correct information – we have been amazed at some of the ignorance of our youth with regard to HIV and AIDS. One would think at this stage with so much information being circulated they would have the correct facts. But there are still many misconceptions where there is limited access to accurate information.

Change of behaviour programmes need to be organized with good follow up. We know the important role that education plays in reducing vulnerability to HIV but in most of the compounds there is no High School. In Chipata Compound, the drop out rate of school going children is 35% We need to try to keep the girl child in school longer and avoid early marriages.

The UN General Assembly a few years ago stated that "poverty, underdevelopment and illiteracy are among the principle contributing factors to the spread of HIV and AIDS." So much remains to be done in this area in Zambia.

In spite of all these challenges, we must have hope as we continue to do what we can to prevent the further spread of HIV and AIDS. We must remember that with God all things are possible. We must continue to try to win the battle against HIV and AIDS and not give up the struggle.

*Sr. Marie O'Brien, FMSA,  
N'gombe Community Home Based Care  
Lusaka, Zambia*

# THE MOVEMENT FOR HIV PREVENTION

*Having greater access to anti-retroviral (ARV) drugs in Zambia for those with HIV and AIDS has dramatically changed their lives and in most cases brought them back to productivity. Unfortunately, access to ARVs in itself has not guaranteed a halt to new infections. In some cases, access to ARVs has contributed to new HIV infections. Professor Michael J. Kelly asserts that the answer to ending the HIV and AIDS pandemic lies in the use of many spears in preventing new infections.*

## ENDURING CRISIS OF HIV AND AIDS

Recent years have seen considerable headway in the global confrontation with the AIDS epidemic. Fewer people are dying from AIDS-related illnesses. A growing number of people are on antiretroviral treatment. The number of children newly infected with HIV is getting smaller. In some countries, infection rates have fallen.

In spite of these gains, the epidemic continues to make unrelenting progress. Each year sees an increase in the number of people living with HIV. There are two reasons for this: a large number of people are becoming newly infected with HIV, and ARVs are helping an increasing number of people with HIV to stay alive. But for every two persons who begin antiretroviral treatment, five more become infected.

Globally, 2.7 million people became newly infected with HIV in 2007, with 1.5 million of these new infections occurring in Eastern and Southern Africa. Nowhere is this ongoing crisis of failure in preventing new HIV infections more marked than in the SADC region. In 2007, this region registered 1.1 million new infections. In other words, a small handful of countries – Angola, Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Mauritius, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe (no data are available for the remaining SADC counties, Seychelles and the DR Congo) – accounted for more than 40 percent of all the new HIV infections that occurred in the world in 2007.

Clearly, it is a matter of the greatest urgency that something be done to stop these new infections – everywhere, but especially in the SADC region where the problem is at its worst. Here in Zambia, on average one person becomes newly infected with HIV every six minutes.

This is altogether too much. As God's children, we know that our loving Father does not want it to be this way, because HIV and AIDS bring such disastrous consequences, distress and pain. Our responsibility is to cooperate with the same loving God in doing everything in our power to stop HIV transmission.

## PREVENTION IS THE ANSWER

Zambia has made great progress in expanding access to antiretroviral drugs (ARVs). It is absolutely wonderful that so many who have HIV can be brought back to life and well-being through these drugs and can experience what has been called their "Lazarus effect". The Ministry of Health, the Churches Health Association of Zambia, and every other provider must continue to do all they can to extend these benefits to every person who is in need of treatment.

But something more is required. Let us never forget that every person who starts taking ARVs means failure in preventing the transmission of HIV. We would be making a great mistake if we let ourselves think that because treatment is available the worst of the epidemic is past. We simply cannot treat our way out of this epidemic. We can never be certain that ARVs will always be available. We

---

**Clearly, it is a matter of the greatest urgency that something be done to stop these new infections – everywhere, but especially in the SADC region where the problem is at its worst.**

---

know that already in some countries, supplies of these costly commodities have begun to dry up because of the global financial crisis. We also know that ARVs can have troublesome side effects and undesirable long-term effects. The drugs are wonderful, but they are not the principal solution to the AIDS epidemic. Instead, as the United Nations affirmed as long ago as 2001, prevention should be the mainstay of our response.

## THE NEED FOR MANY SPEARS

Success in preventing new HIV infections requires sustained, coordinated, consistent and resource-backed action. It also requires the participation of all stakeholders. One of our Zambian proverbs says that an elephant dies because of many spears: *Njamba afwila makunga kuvula*. Nowhere is this more true than in our efforts to kill the rampaging, destructive, destroying



elephant of HIV and AIDS, to overcome this monstrous epidemic, roll it away, and rid our country of it once and for all.

For this, we need many spears. And what are these spears? They are the various measures that individuals, communities, religious authorities, civil society, the private sector and the Government can use to prevent new HIV infections from occurring. There is a very wide range of measures that can stop the transmission of HIV. We need to use whatever ones fit our circumstances, whether as individuals or as communities. In the area of treatment, we know that successful antiretroviral therapy does not depend on a single drug, but uses different ones in the right combination for each individual case. Similarly, successful HIV prevention does not depend on a single intervention, but uses the right combination of several prevention measures.

### **BIO-MEDICAL PREVENTION MEASURES**

Many prevention measures use a technological or bio-medical approach. These include:

1. Stopping the transmission of HIV from mother to child. Where mothers have HIV, about 7% of their babies are likely to get HIV while still in the womb, a further 15% during the process of giving birth, and a still further 13% through breast-feeding. Transmission from mother to child

---

**Similarly, successful HIV prevention does not depend on a single intervention, but uses the right combination of several prevention measures.**

---

accounts for almost 10% of all new HIV infections in Zambia. With the correct medical interventions almost all of these infections can be stopped. Services relating to preventing mother to child transmission are available at more than 900 health centres across the country.

2. Controlling, treating and preventing sexually transmitted infections or STIs. An untreated and especially an ulcerous STI makes it ten times easier for a person to contract HIV. STIs are a major health problem in Zambia, accounting for up to 10% of all outpatient attendances at health institutions.

3. Circumcising boys and men. Circumcision greatly reduces the risk that a man will get HIV from an infected partner, but it does not remove the risk altogether. However, male circumcision does not have any direct effect in preventing the

transmission of HIV from an infected man to an uninfected woman.

4. Screening of blood products. Blood transfusions in Zambia's hospitals are safe since all blood units are screened to ensure that they are HIV-free. In a case of emergency, where blood is collected and used almost at once and without screening, there is no guarantee that it will be HIV-free.

5. Infection control in health care settings. Re-using injection needles that are not properly sterilised can transmit HIV. Traditional healers, who are consulted by very many people in Zambia, must also be educated on prevention control measures so that their procedures do not put their clients at risk of getting HIV.

6. HIV testing and counselling. Testing often helps those who have HIV to change their behaviour so that they will not transmit the disease. But so far there is no strong evidence that those who test negative, i.e., do not have HIV, begin to behave in more responsible ways so that they will remain free from HIV infection.

7. More widespread access to ARVs on the part of those living with HIV. A person who takes ARVs as medically directed can reduce HIV to such low levels in the body that he or she becomes virtually non-infectious.

8. Post-exposure prophylaxis or PEP. A person who might have become infected accidentally, as in a medical setting, or a woman who was raped by somebody who might have had HIV, can be protected against HIV infection by starting on ARVs within 72 hours of the incident, and subsequently staying on those ARVs for 28 days. One in five of Zambia's health facilities offers PEP on site.

### **THE SEARCH FOR NEW MEASURES**

Three other technologies for the prevention of HIV transmission are currently being investigated: pre-exposure prophylaxis or PREP (taking a suitable ARV prior to possible exposure to HIV, in particular prior to engaging in sexual behaviour where there is risk of HIV); microbicides (a gel or cream that can be applied to the vagina or anus and that will block HIV from entering the body); and vaccines (an injection that will make a person immune to HIV infection, either temporally or permanently).

So far, in spite of many initial hopes, there has been no success in developing a vaccine against HIV. The research continues, but scientists warn that we may have to wait more than 20 or 30 years before a successful vaccine will become widely available. The testing of experimental microbicides also continues, but so far none has proved

successful in blocking HIV without doing harm to the individual.

## **PREVENTION MEASURES RELATED TO SEXUAL BEHAVIOUR**

There is an even wider range of prevention measures that depend more on social, cultural and behavioural norms and ways of behaving than on technology. Many of these are expressly in the area of sexual behaviour, but some are in other social and cultural areas. Prevention measures that relate to sexual activity (or refraining from such activity) include:

1. Abstaining from all forms of sexual intercourse. This is the most certain way of preventing the sexual spread of HIV.

2. Remaining faithful to an uninfected partner. This is the only completely sure way in which two persons can engage in sexual activity without the risk of HIV transmission.

3. For young people, delaying the age of first intercourse. As they become older, young people are able to make more mature decisions that lead to more responsible sexual activity. In addition, the delay means postponement of sexual activity until the body tissues are more developed and less likely to admit the virus.

multiple (especially concurrent) sexual partnerships. There is a very high risk of HIV transmission when a person has more than one sexual partner during the same period of time. Multiple and concurrent partnerships, MCPs, are common among all sexually active age groups in Zambia, with 14.4% of men aged 15 to 49 and 1.2% of women reporting that they had more than one sexual partner in the previous year. This practice is one of the major reasons for Zambia's large number of new HIV infections.

5. Eliminating casual and transactional sex. Transactional sex is where sex is given in exchange for money or favours, such as payment of rent, school fees, or food. The practice is common in Zambia and makes a strong contribution to new HIV infections.

6. Cutting out commercial sex. This common practice is believed to account for about 7% of all new HIV infections in Zambia.

7. Stopping sexual activities between young people and partners who are several years older. This practice can transmit HIV from an infected older person to an uninfected younger person who can then infect somebody around the same age. Many girls become infected in this way through "sugar daddies", but boys also get infected through "sugar mommies."

8. Using a good condom (male or female) properly and consistently on every occasion of sexual intercourse that has potential for HIV

transmission. Condom use gives almost 100% protection against becoming infected with HIV, but in Zambia only half the men and much less than half the women adopt this measure when they have high-risk sexual intercourse.

9. Changing practices, such as dry sex, widow cleansing, premarital sex to prove the fertility of young girls, or early marriage for girls, that place people at risk of infection. Each of these practices

---

### **HIV is less likely to be transmitted where the social and cultural circumstances in society are not favourable to it.**

---

increases the risk that the women and girls involved will become infected with HIV. Some traditional leaders are actively trying to persuade their people to adopt other, safer practices.

10. Eliminating all forms of violence against women and children. To our shame, both practices are quite common. Every form of violence is an attack on the human and Christian dignity of a fellow human being. Moreover, sexual violence almost always causes the tearing of body tissues and this makes it easy for HIV to enter. In addition, the violence women experience from their husbands, or the fear of such violence, makes it difficult for many women to start ARVs or to continue using them.

## **SOCIAL, ECONOMIC AND CULTURAL SITUATIONS RELEVANT TO HIV PREVENTION**

HIV is less likely to be transmitted where the social and cultural circumstances in society are not favourable to it. Three of these are of great importance because they relate to the fertile soil in which HIV transmission can prosper. One is ensuring that there is no AIDS-related stigma or discrimination. Stigma causes immense suffering to people. Nelson Mandela once said that many people are not killed by AIDS itself, but by the stigma and discrimination surrounding everybody who has HIV or AIDS. Because of the possible stigma, people may be afraid to learn their HIV status or begin taking ARVs. The result is that many infected people continue to transmit the virus because they do not know their status or are afraid to reveal it.

Secondly, HIV transmission occurs more easily when people do not have enough nutritious food. Under-nourishment makes it easier for HIV to get a foothold in the body. It also makes it easier for an infected person to pass the virus to another person. As concerned Christians, we should always try to

ensure that people have enough of the food and nutrients they need. Reducing the risk of transmitting HIV is a further reason for making sure that this is the case.

Thirdly, controlling alcohol (and drug) use is critical in controlling and reducing the spread of HIV. People who take sizeable amounts of alcohol easily find themselves involved in behaviour that puts them at risk of getting HIV. And apart from behaviour, alcohol weakens the immune system in the body and hence makes it easier to get and transmit HIV. It also speeds up progression from HIV to AIDS and causes some people on ARVs to be careless in taking their medicines as prescribed (and this makes them more infectious).

One final measure is important in Zambia and in every country with high levels of HIV. This is to take what are called universal precautions. Basically, this means assuming that because HIV prevalence is so high amongst us every person we encounter may be infected. Therefore, we take precautions to ensure that we do not come into contact with blood or other body fluids that might carry HIV. In practical terms, this could mean wearing rubber gloves or wrapping plastic bags round our hands when helping in an accident where a person is bleeding.

## TAKING ACTION

Clearly, we have many spears for use in our efforts to block HIV from getting into individuals and communities. Some are large; some are small. But we must be prepared to select from them those that

---

**HIV transmission occurs more easily when people do not have enough nutritious food. Under-nourishment makes it easier for HIV to get a foothold in the body.**

---

are locally relevant and are likely to work best in a given situation. In the terms proposed by the United Nations in 2001, whatever measures we adopt must take account of the local situation and respond to the ethical and cultural values of individuals and communities.

But it is not enough just to talk about these measures. We must do something about them. We must apply them. We must put them to use. We must do so in our own lives, and we must help others to do so in their lives. If we take such action, we can hope that each passing year will see a reduction in the number of new infections.

## THE FIFTY BY FIFTEEN MOVEMENT

The SADC countries are aiming at halving the number of new infections in the region by 2015. The movement directed to this is called *Fifty by Fifteen* (a 50% reduction in new HIV infections by 2015). The target is to reduce new infections in the SADC region by about half a million in less than six years. Small as it may seem, the SADC 50%-reduction target is very ambitious and greatly exceeds the global accomplishment of reducing new infections by 300,000 in the six years between 2001 and 2007.

The number of new infections in Zambia remains high. It is estimated that 83,000 adults and 9,000 children will become newly infected in 2009. The 2015 target for Zambia is to prevent altogether these 9,000 new infections in children and to reduce new adult infections to around 40,000. This means that, if it is to reach its target, Zambia will have to prevent about 50,000 new infections between now and 2015. This is possible. In 1990/1991, about 152,000 Zambians aged 15–49 became infected in one year. In the nineteen years since then, this number fell by about 70,000 (almost a half) to 83,000. The challenge is to ensure that the decline will continue so that by 2015 there will be far fewer new HIV infections.

The targets can be achieved, in Zambia and throughout the region, provided everybody recognizes the challenge, faces up to it and takes the necessary steps. ***We can slow down and stop the AIDS epidemic.*** The billion-kwacha question is whether we are prepared to change our behaviour so that we will do so.

## NEED TO CHANGE SOCIAL AND CULTURAL NORMS

Permanent progress against HIV and AIDS requires one further step. This is to change the gender norms that guide and frequently dictate sexual practices. Our society tends to be organised around the belief and behaviour that somehow males are superior and females are inferior. In the sexual sphere, this shows itself in the way men control the sexual decision-making process and also in the way men are allowed great freedom in sexual practices.

One practical outcome is that it is the man who decides on the nature, timing, place and method of sexual activity, while the woman is expected to agree passively to these male decisions. Nobody complains much about the loose sexual activity of men, but anything like the same kind of activity in women is strongly condemned. But the same mentality also leads to such high-risk and unacceptable situations as rape within marriage, men having many partners, older men looking for relationships with younger girls, sexual violence, and many other forms of high-risk behaviour.

These images of what a man may do and what a woman may do are formed by the values, attitudes and traditions developed in our communities and passed on to children from a very early age. What is needed is to replace these images by new ones that celebrate the full equality of men and women and that acknowledge that “all human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights”, as the *Universal Declaration on Human Rights* states.

In January 2007, Pope Benedict XVI spoke very strongly about the unjust and persisting inequalities between men and women in the exercise of their basic rights. In particular, he drew attention to the exploitation of women who are treated as objects and to the mindset persisting in some cultures, where women are still firmly subordinated to the arbitrary decisions of men.

If we hear what the Pope is saying, we will do something about changing our social norms so that they give a higher status to women, but without reducing the status of men. Then we will really be getting rid of one of the factors that drives the HIV and AIDS epidemic.

Even more, we will be creating a society where women and men can live their lives to the full as truly equal individuals created in the image and likeness of God. “Male and female he created them, in the image and likeness of God he created them” (Gen. 1:27). Within God, there is no subordination. Neither should there be any subordination between men and women. Each is like to God. Each is an image of God. Each must respect and treat the other as an equal child of God.

If each one of us made this value central to our lives and the basis of our attitudes and behaviour, we would see an end to many of the sexual practices that put people at risk of getting or transmitting HIV. And we would also come closer to realising in our communities and throughout Zambia the great vision of Saint Paul, “there can be neither male nor female – for you are all one in Christ” (Gal. 3:28).

*Michael J. Kelly, S.J.*  
*Luwisha House*  
*Lusaka*

## ARTICLES AND LETTERS

We would like to encourage lively analytical exchange on the views raised in our *Bulletin*. We will be more than happy to read your views. The length of your article should be between 1000 and 1500 words on any social, economic, political, educational, cultural, pastoral, theological and spiritual theme.

The next issue of the JCTR *Bulletin* (third quarter) will be out in October 2009. So to contribute, please write articles or letters to the Editor either by regular mail to JCTR, P.O. Box 37774, Lusaka, Zambia; or by e-mail to [jctr@jesuits.org.zm](mailto:jctr@jesuits.org.zm). The deadline for submissions is 30 September 2009.

We look forward to hearing from you!



# TIME TO FIGHT THE GOOD FIGHT OF CORRUPTION EFFECTIVELY

*Corruption remains rampant in Zambia despite the current efforts by Government and some civil society groups. The Auditor General's reports and the Anti-corruption Commission (ACC) reports continue to uncover abuse of public funds but little action seems to be taken to bring those accused to answer for their actions. Trevor Simumba uses Scripture to contribute to ways of fighting corruption in Zambia.*

*Fight the good fight of faith (Timothy 6:12)*

These words are especially fitting for this discussion, as they were written by the Apostle Paul to a young believer named Timothy. The Apostle Paul was a great fighter. Just as Paul admonished us to fight the good fight of faith, we are all today admonished to fight against the growing evil of corruption and impunity that has seeped into the very fabric of Zambia's life. His fighting was partly against internal and external enemies – against hardships of all kinds. Five times he was scourged by the Jews, three times by the Romans; he suffered shipwreck four times; and was in perils of waters, in perils of robbers, in perils by his own countrymen, in perils by the heathen, in perils in the city, in perils in the wilderness, in perils in the sea, in perils among false brethren. Paul never stopped fighting till his death.

Fortunately, he was a true fighter; and by God's grace he not only fought, but he won. The human instruments which God uses in great triumphs of faith are not pacifists, but great fighters like Paul himself. It is the same old story today of huge amounts of money being misappropriated or just plainly stolen. For how long will this nation turn a blind eye to this abuse of our resources? Surely, a stop must be put to this impunity in our beloved nation of Zambia. It is time to stand up and fight the good fight against corruption and win!

## **ACTION, NOT JUST WORDS!**

The late President Mwanawasa is credited with having put the fight against corruption high on Zambia's political agenda, with initiatives such as the constitution of a Task Force on Economic Plunder, the design of a corruption prevention strategy and the reinforcement of institutions such as the Auditor General and the Anti-Corruption Commission. In spite of some progress made, most indicators of corruption and the recent revelations of Grand Corruption within the Mwanawasa regime suggest that these efforts have not yielded the expected results.

Major lessons learnt from recent anti-corruption efforts in Zambia include the importance of adopting a holistic approach to anti-corruption activities that

combine both punitive and preventive approaches as well as the need to strengthen the role of non-state actors and focus on actual implementation of anti-corruption commitment. High level political will, prioritisation, sequencing and interagency coordination are important factors likely to facilitate the effective implementation of anti-corruption efforts.

It should be noted that corruption poses a serious development challenge in Zambia with our economic growth stifled due to the large amounts of money siphoned off for personal gain. In the political realm, it undermines democracy and good governance by

---

**Major lessons learnt from recent anti-corruption efforts in Zambia include the importance of adopting a holistic approach to anti-corruption that combines both punitive and preventive approaches.**

---

subverting formal processes. In broad terms, corruption is the abuse of public office for private gain. It encompasses unilateral abuses by Government officials such as embezzlement and nepotism, as well as abuses linking public and private actors such as bribery, extortion, influence peddling, and fraud. Corruption arises in both political and bureaucratic offices and can be petty or grand, organized or unorganized.

With the sorts of figures floating around the office corridors and the streets of Zambia, one would hasten to say we are facing serious organized "Grand Corruption" of immense proportions that involves high level criminal business people, politicians and bureaucrats, including donor organizations that are abetting this theft and turning an expedient blind eye to the abuse of resources. Why has it taken so long for these scams to come to light now when all this time donors have been praising the Zambian Government and making it seem like corruption in Zambia only started in 1991?

It should be noted that corruption erodes the institutional capacity of Government as procedures

are disregarded, resources are siphoned off, and officials are hired or promoted without regard to performance. At the same time, corruption undermines the legitimacy of Government and such democratic values as trust and tolerance. There is no need for examples as most Zambians are living the effects of corruption on a daily basis with poor water and sanitation, damaged roads, disasters, poor health and education facilities and premature deaths amongst a large segment of our society.

Corruption also undermines economic development by generating considerable distortions and inefficiency. In the private sector, corruption increases the cost of doing business through the price of illicit payments themselves, the management

---

**Corruption further generates economic distortions in the public sector by diverting public investment away from education and into capital projects where bribes and kickbacks are more plentiful.**

---

cost of negotiating with corrupt inept officials, and the risk of breached agreements or detection. Where corruption inflates the cost of business, it also distorts the playing field, shielding firms with connections from competition and thereby sustaining inefficient firms. It further generates economic distortions in the public sector by diverting public investment away from education and into capital projects where bribes and kickbacks are more plentiful (e.g., roads, bridges, security projects). Officials may increase the technical complexity of public sector projects to conceal such dealings, thus further distorting investment. From the above it is very clear that corruption is a cancer that if allowed to continue to grow will kill this nation of Zambia. One must wonder whether we have any decent public servants out there that will help redeem this country from failure.

Nigeria when it faced this problem enacted a very sound law, ECONOMIC AND FINANCIAL CRIMES COMMISSION (ESTABLISHMENT) ACT of 2004, which established an Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC). This body is the designated Financial Intelligence Unit (FIU) in Nigeria, which is charged with the responsibility of coordinating the various institutions involved in the fight against money laundering and enforcement of all laws dealing with economic and financial crimes in Nigeria.

### **WAY TO GO IN THE FIGHT**

It is time Zambia enacted a similar law and established the **Zambia Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (ZEFCC)**. This body should take over all the operations of the Taskforce on

Corruption, ACC, DEC and the forensic audit team at the Auditor General's office. It should be reporting to the National Defence and Security Council chaired by the President and also to the Parliamentary Public Accounts Committee when it involves a public servant.

It must have strong and wide powers to investigate any Financial and Economic crime no matter the level of authority of that public official. For example, the EFCC in Nigeria was able to investigate the former Vice President of Nigeria Atiku Abubakar, even though it was shrouded in legal and political challenges. In line with establishing such a commission, there should be a National Public Service Code of Conduct that will direct the operations of all public service organizations and employees. It is important for the fight against corruption to be transparent and accountable and not subject to the whims of the Executive alone.

ZEFCC would comprise highly motivated Zambian experts in the fields of law, senior State Counsels, security and intelligence operatives, forensic audit experts, commercial fraud experts, economic analysts, business sector analysts, banking and financial experts, anti-money laundering experts and many other patriotic Zambians that would ensure that the scourge of corruption is removed once and for all, never to see its ugly head again. We can look again at the establishment of the Special Investigations Team on Economy and Trade (SITET) in the First Republic, which unfortunately became a political tool against those seen as anti-Government. However, it initially was very successful before being closed down and disbanded by the Chiluba regime. We could also look at the United States Federal Bureau of Investigations and also the Scorpions in South Africa (which has suffered the same fate as SITET) who have shown good success in the corruption fight.

It is hoped that those attending the National Constitutional Conference (NCC) will consider this humble suggestion and institute a robust legal framework within the Constitution to remove the discretionary power that the President has on these matters. Otherwise, come 2012 we will have even more former leaders and senior public servants attending never-ending court sessions as the People of Zambia will want answers to the many questions they have on how Government is abusing their resources in the name of good fiscal management and zero tolerance to corruption. Let us match our words with our deeds. FAITH without action is DEAD!

*Trevor Simumba  
Economic Consultant  
United Kingdom*

# THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE RECENT G8 DISCUSSIONS FOR ZAMBIA

*The global economic crisis that rocked the world in late 2008 and early 2009 continues to have effects on global and domestic economies. Finding ways of dealing with the crisis has been key at both global and local levels. The leaders of the G8 in its deliberations addressed specific areas of the economy that included climate change, with the hope of continued growth in economies. Humphrey Mulemba discusses the main areas discussed at the G8 summit as they relate to Zambia's economic and social challenges.*

The G8 is comprised of France, United States, United Kingdom, Russia, Germany, Japan, Italy, and Canada. This year's summit was held in Italy between 8-10 July, with Brazil, India, China, South Africa and the EU additionally present. This showed the gravity of issues at hand and the fact that the emerging powers have a role to play. The summit came in the context of three important issues that are shaping the world thinking on development directly and indirectly. The first is that the summit occurred just after the Pope Benedict XVI's encyclical, *Caritas in Veritate*, which is Latin for "Charity in Truth."

The second is the divergent views on whether there is recovery from the Global Economic Crises (GEC) or these signs of recovery are benefiting a few and are simply false hopes for the majority -- considering the persistent job losses, high costs of living and continuing challenges of poverty. Lastly, a very important debate impacting on the livelihood and well being of people in both the developing world and developed world is climate change. With all that in mind, the Chair's summary of the G8 captures Trade, the World Economy, Climate Change, Development and Africa, the G8 and Africa, Food Security and International Political Issues as the core topics that were discussed. Many will ask what does this mean for Zambia, how should the country react and what more does Zambia expect from the G8? Here is a brief analysis.

## TRADE

The G8 leaders stressed that open markets are key to economic growth and development – the more so in a period of crisis. Though trade is positively linked to economic growth, findings from the 2009 report by the World Trade Organisation (WTO) and the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) show the contrary. Trade by itself cannot deliver to meet poverty reduction with equity. In fact, according to the report, studies cited in it found an increase in inequality. The World Bank (2005) concluded that during the 1990s countries with rapid economic growth and trade liberalisation achieved absolute poverty reduction but experienced increased inequality. Kremer and Maskin (2007) established that increased trade has tended to benefit

elites in both rich and poor countries, thus increasing income inequalities.

Zambia is a victim of this. The country is among the most liberalised in Africa, yet rural poverty far outweighs urban poverty and all of this while the majority of the population resides in the rural areas. Therefore, the G8 should be urged to recognise that liberal reforms need to occur with the supporting accompaniment of strong institutions, effective regulation and equity.

## THE WORLD ECONOMY

The aspect of this debate most relevant to Zambia is the vow by the leaders of the G8 to ensure that they need to address excessive price volatility on the global commodity markets. False ideas can change the behaviour of markets, given sufficient prevalence, and one can profit from these false ideas. Few realise that base metal prices fluctuated by more than 60% during the recession but real demand did not actually reduce by more than 10%. Even though copper and other base metals have shown signs of recovery in price on the international market, there is no guarantee of price stability. So long as price setting in international markets is done where speculators have more influence on price than producing countries, a part of Zambia's economy will forever remain at the mercy of profit seeking

---

**Trade by itself cannot deliver to meet poverty reduction with equity. In fact, according to the report, studies cited in it found an increase in inequality.**

---

individuals and companies. These do not take responsibility for the impact that their behavior has on peoples livelihoods, children's education, peoples' health care and ability to meet basic needs. Therefore, the G8 is even further urged to clamp down and stiffen the penalties on speculation that does not reflect real demand trends and is detrimental to commodity dependent developing countries.

## CLIMATE CHANGE

The G8 agreed on a global long-term goal of reducing global emissions by at least 50% by 2050 and, as part of this, 80% or more reduction goal for developed countries by 2050. More importantly, they highlighted the adaptation needs of developing countries in terms of resources, capacity building and policy support, particularly for the poor and most vulnerable. In Zambia, the Climate Change Facilitation Unit (CCFU) was recently setup in June of this year, housed by the Ministry of Tourism Environment and Natural Resources. The challenge now remains in mainstreaming the realities of climate change into the broader development agenda of Zambia, especially in the Sixth National Development Plan. According to the Inter-Governmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) Report 2007, 75 -250 million people across Africa could face water shortages by 2020. Crop yields from rainfall-fed agriculture could drop by 50 percent in some African countries,

---

**For Zambia, liberalisation has shown that it does not address poverty with equity but instead increases inequality.**

---

including Zambia. The report provides a comprehensive analysis of how crosscutting climate change is and how it is affecting natural and human systems from health, to wildlife in the tourism sector, to development of power generation, and to increase in trade capacity. If sustainable development is to be achieved, concerted efforts by all Government ministries is needed to overcome this challenge. The G8 is urged to be even more ambitious by actually meeting the new targets as opposed to their abysmal shortcomings in meeting the Kyoto protocol commitments.

## DEVELOPMENT AND AFRICA

The G8 decided to implement a set of measures to help the most vulnerable to withstand the global economic crisis. These include, to: fulfill their ODA commitments including on aid for trade; keep markets open to re-launch economic growth to the benefit of the poor; enhance transparency and competition among intermediaries to halve transaction cost of migrants' remittances; strengthen partnership with Africa to improve access to water and sanitation; support innovative financing instruments for health; put agriculture and food security at the top of the agenda by increasing multilateral financing to support comprehensive country strategies and improving coordination of existing mechanisms.

For Zambia, liberalisation has shown that it does not address poverty with equity but instead increases inequality. Therefore, Zambia needs to recognise that as a result of this market failure due to liberalisation

Government will need to intervene in the market. It must provide the necessary support structures to enable the vulnerable in society to meet their basic needs. The most important role the G8 will need to play here is live up to their commitments and begin taking steps to remove trade-restricting and trade distorting protectionist measures that the countries imposed when the crisis began.

## G8 AND AFRICA

Leaders from the G8 met with leaders of several African countries, the African Union Commission and relevant International Organisations to seek ways to limit the impact of the crisis on the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in Africa. However, the reality is that in Zambia, the MDGs are under strain due to factors such as climate change, lessened support from donors due to the economic crises, and systemic corruption. The G8 countries are amongst the most responsible for contributing to the climate change induced by human activity and they are also the main donors in the international community. The G8 countries have to make sure that aid is "charity in truth" where there is sincerity in the support that is given and donors lend responsibly in recognition of country priorities.

## FOOD SECURITY

The G8 leaders committed to mobilise US\$20 billion over three years through the L'Aquila Food Security Initiative in support of rural development in poor countries. This included G8 commitments to keep agriculture at the core of the international agenda, re-launch investments and boost aid and in country coordination with the involvement of all relevant stakeholders. Zambia has seen a growing number of land investments for agricultural development. But Zambia should ensure that this development is for the benefit of the people. Food security is central to meeting basic needs. In times of shortages, people are wary about having foreigners owning local land. Therefore, there will be need for safeguards against exports during times of famine or drought in order to increase yield, transfer technology and create jobs. When taking up this responsibility, the G8 must support sustainable best practices and ensure that the current trend of multinationals' purchasing large areas of farmland are not at the expense of food security for the local people in the least developed countries.

## RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ZAMBIA

This is a wake-up call for Zambia. As the rich and powerful G8 have met to map out the way forward on emergent issues during trying times, Zambia too needs to rise to the challenges ahead which require addressing the problems of today and preparing for the challenges of tomorrow. In order to achieve this,



Zambia needs firstly to ensure that the institutions to regulate the free market are available and adequately equipped to do so.

Secondly, there is need for a strong, simple and transparent regulatory framework to guide the regulation of the free-market and ensure that where market failure occurs Government adequately intervenes to ensure the vulnerable are protected. Thirdly, Government must work with the Bank of Zambia to build capitalisation levels of financial institutions to enable them to take on greater risk and lend at higher levels through policies to accelerate development of different sectors of the economy.

Lastly, the time has come to recognise climate change as an impediment to development and begin to undertake measures that will counteract the cross cutting challenges that it will pose. Action by both Zambia and the G8 on emerging issues is the next most important step after identifying the challenges that the country and world is faced with.

Humphrey Mulemba, Jr.  
JCTR Staff  
Lusaka, Zambia

### **Excerpt from Amartya Sen's interview on his new book (2009), *The Idea of Justice***

*Justice is a complex idea (I was not surprised that it took me 496 pages to discuss it), but it is very important to understand that justice has much to do with everyone being treated fairly. Even though that connection has been well discussed by the leading political philosopher of our time, John Rawls, I have argued that he neglects a couple of important connections. One neglect is the central recognition that a theory of justice has to be deeply concerned with systematic assessment of how to reduce injustice in the world, rather than only with the identification of what a hypothetical "perfectly just society" would look like.*

*There may be no agreement on the shape of perfect justice (and also perfect justice will hardly be achievable even if people did agree about what would be immaculately just), but we can still have reasoned agreement on many removable cases of manifest injustice, for example, slavery, or subjugation of women, or widespread hunger and deprivation, or the lack of schooling of children, or absence of available and affordable health care.*

*Second, analysis of justice has to pay attention to the lives that people are actually able to lead, rather than exclusively concentrating only on the nature of "just institutions". In India, as anywhere else, we have to concentrate on removing injustices that are identifiable and that can be remedied.*

# ROMANTICISING POVERTY: IS POVERTY A NEW WORLD BUSINESS?

*One way or the other, we all benefit from poverty. Sad as this might be, should we then accept the conventional methods of fighting poverty that seem to look at poverty as a "good"? For decades now, the fight to end global poverty has intensified with several ways tried and abandoned. Some of the popular ones include the structural adjustment programmes (SAPs) and the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). The fear is that most of the strategies to fight poverty are merely becoming a business that is not benefiting the poor. Directing funds to actual poverty eradication programmes and redistribution of world wealth are what Dominic Liche suggests to end both poverty and the immoral new world business.*

The levels of poverty in the world continue to rise even though riches in the world also continue to grow. Whilst many people in the world are becoming poor by the day, very few people (about 10% of the world population) are becoming extremely rich. In the Zambian situation, it is estimated that about 64% Zambians are poor (living below US\$1 a day – the number is higher considering that now poverty is measured against those living below US\$1.25 a day). However, this measurement of poverty is inadequate because even US\$1.25 a day is not enough to live by. Worldwide, out of 6.7 billion people, 1.4 billion people are poor. This means 1 in every 6 persons is poor.

According to the World Institute for Development Economics Research of the United Nations University, the richest 1% in the world own 40% of global assets and the richest 10% of the world own 85% of global assets. In the world of plenty, only a small percentage of persons own the world's wealth. This means that 90% of the world's population have to share only 15% of world's resources. This is a morally unacceptable fact that needs to be dealt with in poverty eradicating strategies.

It is becoming very clear that economic growth alone in the world is not the answer to ending poverty. Neither are good research documents. Despite the many approaches to tackling poverty,

---

**History is beginning to show that the fight against poverty is as illusive as a mirage. Just when one thinks that this is the best way of fighting poverty, new challenges come up that show the failure of that method.**

---

poverty has not significantly decreased but actually continues to rise. The divide between the rich and the poor continues to widen. Africa is one of those continents that is cited to have the most of the world's poor. Organisations like the International Monetary

Fund (IMF), the World Bank, and the United Nations continue to give perspectives and initiatives for fighting poverty.

History is beginning to show that the fight against poverty is as illusive as a mirage. Just when one thinks that this is the best way of fighting poverty, new challenges come up that show the failure of that method. Poverty is more popular than riches. When I searched for "poverty" on [www.google.com](http://www.google.com), I had 55.2 million hits, whilst "riches" only got 18.4 million hits (and I guess these hits increase by the day). Many people in the academic, NGO world and Government talk about poverty more than about wealth creation.

In recent years, in the late 1990s and early 2000s, a new world business seems to have boomed in making money out of extreme poverty and incurable diseases, especially AIDS. This world business is so disguised that most of us seem not to realise the seriousness of benefiting from social evils. This article seeks to uncover the various ways in which poverty and disease are tools for generation of world wealth and tries to indicate that it is immoral to accept this trend as normal.

## DEFINING "ROMANTICISING POVERTY"

The Encarta Dictionary 2006, describes poverty as the "state of being poor, the state of not having enough money to take care of basic needs such as food, clothing, and housing and a deficiency or lack of something." Poverty is the lack of power to live one's life as one wishes it to be. This lack of power (empowerment to access basic needs) actually strips human beings of their dignity and sometimes makes human beings to go to extra-ordinary lengths (like begging, prostitution, working for meagre remuneration) to earn one's living. Something that is "romantic" is exciting and usually in a sexual way. To romanticise something is to look at something in an exciting way.

Poverty has become an exciting business for it pays and benefits many people. Persons working and dealing with poverty look at poverty in an exciting way. I have been at many meetings where people are giving powerful and exciting presentations (often in a posh hotel). One can begin to idealise poverty as a social good rather than be disgusted by it. Western donors (recently called “cooperating partners”) pour billions of dollars into poverty alleviating programmes and often those implementing the programmes live in riches with little impact on the lives of poor people.

Sometime in 2004, I was at a meeting on HIV and AIDS considering how many poor people die unnecessarily early because of their condition of poverty. Some people living with HIV marched outside of the posh hotel where we were holding the meeting, demanding to know which people the conference was seeking to address. Sadly, the marching people were not even allowed into the hotel by security guards.

Poverty and disease as romantic concepts have made the fight against poverty unachievable. What this has made of the two is many “unnecessary” workshops, trainings, research papers, dissertations, and even applications for donor aid. One wonders the good we would do if we were actually to collect all the monies poured into these things (researches, workshops, dissertations, applications) and actually use it on the poor.

### “DEVELOPMENT PORNOGRAPHY”

With the romantic poverty around us, one key aspect of it is “pornography” for development. Millions of pictures of poor Africans and Asians are displayed on TV, in research documents, in magazines, in newspapers and in books to tell the story of poverty. Although such pictures are meant to tell the story, recently these pictures are just tools to make money and lure rich countries and rich people into giving aid. It is annoying to see that most of these pictures (usually of children dying of malnutrition, persons whose bodies are emaciated due to AIDS, war and rape) becoming acceptable in our society. Some organisations, mostly international ones, seem to have concentrated much more into finding people in these conditions to get pictures and display in their workshops and publications.

I call this “pornography” since such pictures, though they do not stimulate people in a sexual way as most pornographic materials do, these pictures are mostly of nude people (e.g., of those of malnourished children, or of AIDS patients) that either directly earn people money or elicit feelings in people to give money to the poor. Let me not be misunderstood here, for some of these pictures honestly need to be seen. But when such pictures of poverty and diseases are seen in almost an exciting way because they earn us money, they just

perpetuate the idea of looking at poverty and disease in a “romantic” way.

## DIFFERENT WAYS OF ROMANTICISING POVERTY

Poverty is romanticised in many ways and often by non-governmental organisations and research institutions. Most of these organizations working for poverty have a commitment to fighting poverty but the ways of doing so is what is problematic. Mostly they take the models proposed by the World Bank, IMF, and the UN and try to implement them even when, these models do not work. We have seen this with the likes of the Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs). Here are some of the ways in which poverty is romanticised.

**(1) RESEARCH AND PUBLICATIONS:** Many researches and consultancies are done on poverty. Conclusions of most of these researches have gobbled up billions of US dollars. Most of these researches are predictable (like the causes of poverty or the impact of good governance on poverty alleviation) where it does not make sense to even begin such a research. Some of the researches are redundant where the results of research will never ever be used. These types of researches only end up

---

**I have been at many meetings where people are giving powerful and exciting presentations (often in a posh hotel). One can begin to idealise poverty as a social good rather than be disgusted by it.**

---

shelved in people’s offices or universities or, if lucky, published in a prestigious journal. Does it make sense, for example, to spend millions of dollars on a research project on the problem of access to food as it relates to the quality of life of persons with AIDS? It is a given fact that without good nutrition, one cannot easily fight disease. Why then not pour those millions, not into research, but to some persons who need food?

We are often defeated by the thought that since there are many people living in poverty, helping just one or ten does not make a difference. But honestly it does, and sometimes even just feeding a person for a day makes a difference. No matter how many good publications (books, journal articles, magazine articles, bulletins) we produce on poverty, no matter how many researches we produce on poverty, if we do not act on poverty, our efforts are useless even when such materials make exciting reading (and sometimes they do because of the romantic way poverty stories are told).

**(2) ACADEMICS** – Most academic institutions have very interesting courses on poverty. Social

work, economics, development studies, medicine, psychology, public health are all well known for exploring theories on poverty. One of the popular courses in this area is “poverty and development.” There are even interesting courses like “poverty, conflict and reconstruction.” Courses have mushroomed in the HIV and AIDS area. You can now even do a Doctor of Philosophy degree (PhD) in HIV and AIDS. Interestingly, most public health and sociology dissertations, especially in Africa, are on HIV and AIDS. These might be good dissertations even when they are sometimes redundant. But the motives for doing most of these dissertations are problematic that include quick graduation and better chances of finding jobs since there are many organizations and Government departments dealing with HIV and AIDS.

When I was choosing a topic for a dissertation in medical ethics, many people kept suggesting topics relating to HIV and AIDS, with some interesting ones like “Attitudes of Zambians Towards Condom Use in the HIV and AIDS Era” or “Ethical Considerations on Prostitution in the Time of AIDS” or “Polygamy and HIV Transmission – An Ethical Investigation” or “The Catholic Church and Condom Use” or even “Gender-based Violence and HIV and AIDS.” Without trivialising these topics, it is easier to graduate with such topics than topics like “Euthanasia in Zambia” or “The Benefits of In-vitro Fertilisation to Families that Cannot Easily Have Children” or “Consideration of Cloning in Zambia.” The first question that most ask is “what kind of job are you going to find in Zambia with such a topic as euthanasia, for example?”

So, our education has become job-oriented and not issue-related or knowledge-related. Poverty and diseases make job hunting easier and most study these disciplines not necessarily to alleviate poverty or disease but to find a job. Now this is a big accusation but maybe very true in many respects. I

---

### **We could actually feed more persons a day than persons that die just by using presentation fees.**

---

know many people who have studied gender or HIV and AIDS to find jobs, with no real commitment to fighting gender problems or contributing towards the end of HIV and AIDS. I have interviewed some persons for a gender job and many persons seeking the job could not even define what gender is. Social ills are exciting and we sometimes study them for jobs and personal gain.

**(3) GETTING PAID FOR TALKING ABOUT POVERTY** – Most meetings and most researches on poverty and how to end it are good for some extra money. We get paid just to talk about poverty. A good presentation on poverty at a big conference can easily earn one US\$250, yet that same money on the

US\$1.25 a day rating could feed 200 people. Now consider how much money go to presentation fees in conferences worldwide a day – maybe 1000 and how many people per conference, maybe 5, and consider just how many people could be fed a day using such money. My quick calculation gives me 1 million people fed a day. Yet the United Nations estimate that about 25, 000 persons die of hunger every day. We could actually feed more persons a day than persons that die just by using presentation fees. Without promoting laziness or overdependence, is it not better to feed people or begin empowering a million people a day than paying such money to people who are already rich?

Some people have stopped being committed to their full-time jobs in Government, in NGOs and in universities because of the extra cash that making

---

### **Our moral challenge today in the world is to act against poverty not just in slogans, publications, dissertations, and researches but actually channelling resources and energy to fighting poverty.**

---

such presentations gives. Even attending meetings on poverty and diseases is paying. In the Zambian situation, there are terms such as “transport refunds” or “sitting allowance” that are given to participants of meetings. Sometimes without such money, no one turns up for a meeting. Now since when do we begin paying people for sitting down to listen to talks on poverty? Or better still, shouldn't we be charging for people to be empowered on ways to deal with poverty or better still shouldn't we be channeling such resources towards actual fight against poverty – such as cash transfer schemes, or helping children to be educated?

Meetings on poverty have become a big new world business not just for persons but for lodges and hotels. On average to hold a meeting at a hotel in Zambia for one day costs about K7 million (US\$1, 400). This amount could feed about 1120 persons per meeting per day. It is questionable how many of these meetings yield results. Most of them end up even without any follow-up or even a report. Now how many such meetings occur in the whole world a day? Let us get a decent number of 1000 meetings a day. This easily gives us US\$1.4 million a day and this could easily feed 1.12 million people a day. Despite my figures being mere speculations, in reality there is so much money spent on meetings on poverty that could very easily help to actually end poverty. The next time you attend a meeting on poverty, ask yourself, “Is it necessary to have such a meeting and why should I be paid for attending or presenting at such a meeting?” Most especially when most of the people that attend such meetings are already in regular employment.



**(4) MAKING PROFITS OUT OF POVERTY** – We make profits out of poverty rather than actually do something to end world poverty. People have become famous because of poverty. Some have won Nobel Prizes because of poverty. Some have got PhDs because of poverty. Some have become saints because of poverty. There are businesses (corporate ones and small scale) because of poverty. The big question is that is it moral to continue along this path in the fight against poverty? Shouldn't we be doing more in the actual fight and not theorising, workshopping, talking, giving powerpoint presentations on poverty?

### **MORAL CHALLENGE**

Our moral challenge today in the world is to act against poverty not just in slogans, publications, dissertations, and researches but actually channelling resources and energy to fighting poverty. Considering the amount of resources and energy that is wasted in workshops, researches, international conferences and meetings, these could greatly help in ending world poverty. The myth that feeding one person out

of the billions of people that live in poverty worldwide is futile is not the way of proceeding. Even empowering one person or ten persons helps because these are human beings and not just figures. One failure of academics and researchers is that they often reduce real problems like poverty and disease to mere numbers (percentages and other statistical figures), thereby obscuring the problems. The real problem in poverty eradication is the failure to channel resources to effective programmes dealing with poverty and the failure to equitably distribute world resources to all. Poverty continues to grow in a world of plenty for obvious reasons – the richest 10% continue to amass wealth thereby increasing the number living in poverty. This way of romanticising poverty where poverty has become a social good since it pays and we get jobs out of it must come to an end. Poverty hurts real persons and not numbers or percentages we see in researches and publications (even in this one!).

*Dominic Liche  
JCTR Staff  
Lusaka, Zambia*

## **THE OPTIONAL PROTOCOL TO THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS (ICESCR)**

JCTR and other Civil Society Organisations like Caritas Zambia, have been urging the Government of Zambia – and other governments – to sign the United Nation's (UN) Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) when it opens for signature at the UN General Assembly meeting on 24 September 2009. This is one way of demanding access to justice for the thousands of people who suffer economic, social and cultural rights (ESCR) violations everyday, without redress. In the Zambian situation, the current Constitution shows very little commitment to the promotion of ESCR. Actually, these rights are not justiciable or legally enforceable denying citizens their ability to demand for these important rights.

This is despite the fact that Government of Zambia has signed on to many international treaties on human rights like the Universal Declaration on Human Rights and the African Charter on Human and People's Rights that demand commitment to ESCR. Zambia ratified the ICESCR in 1984. Among its provisions, the ICESCR requires Zambia to "take steps . . . to the maximum of its available resources, with a view to achieving progressively the full realization of ESCR by all appropriate means, including particularly the adoption of legislative measures." ESCR protected in the treaty include the right to free and compulsory education, physical and mental healthcare, adequate food, and social security. While the Government is duty-bound to uphold the treaty by virtue of ratification, so far it has failed to implement the treaty in domestic law.

Lacking mechanisms to ensure ESCR promotion makes it even more critical for the Government to sign, ratify and implement the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR as soon as possible. Once the Optional Protocol is in place, Zambians who suffer ESCR violations can lodge individual complaints with the Committee on ESCR. **In the absence of a domestic mechanism for vindicating ESCR, we must join together to ensure that Zambia signs the Optional Protocol on 24 September.**

# DR. MOYO'S PROPOSAL TO ABOLISH DEVELOPMENT AID

*Dambisa Moyo's book, "Dead Aid" has aroused a lot of debate on development aid. Her thesis has mainly been that aid has not led to development but underdevelopment, corruption, and dictatorships. She has argued further that aid should be stopped in the next five years. Maarten de Zeeuw, an expert in the area of tax administration and tax policy working in Less Developed Countries and Mwangala Mubita, a Master of Business Administration (MBA) from Zambia, argue for a different view of aid than that of Moyo. They stress that aid cannot in itself lead to development but can address emergencies, lower the burden of hunger and disease, and help in the general welfare of lives of the poor.*

In March 2009, financial expert and native Zambian Dr. Dambisa Moyo drew worldwide attention with her book *Dead Aid* (Allen Lane, 2009, ISBN 978-1-846-14006-8), arguing for abolition of development aid to Africa. This idea is not exactly new. Not only in donor countries, but also in recipient countries, more and more voices are raised for the abolition of development aid. Strictly on itself this is a quite good thing – as long as it is accompanied by the firm will and a proper plan to achieve in the fastest possible manner a situation where financial resources and hands-on knowledge of recipient countries are adequate. If the issue of the investment climate would be addressed, this might be possible in the major part of Africa twenty or thirty years from now.

However Dr. Moyo's proposal is more radical than that. She wants African self-reliance to be brought about by a unilateral termination within five years (p. 144; or five to ten years, p. 76) of all development aid to all African countries, irrespective of their stage of development.

This abolitionist view, which advocates direct abolition instead of reform or intensification, is a point of view adopted before by Nobel Prize laureate Milton Friedman and the Britons, Peter Bauer and Graham Hancock. Nowadays they are joined by libertarians, business people and nationalists from recipient countries themselves, such as Dr. Moyo, but also the Kenyan self-taught economist James Shikwati, the Ugandan journalist Andrew Mwenda, the Ghanaian IT-pioneer Herman Chinnery-Hesse, the Ghanaian economist and democracy propagandist George Ayittey and the South African journalist and economist Moeletsi Mbeki (brother of Thabo Mbeki).

This powerful current provides multitude of arguments. Hundreds of billions of US dollars have been spent on development aid for Africa, but this has hardly resulted in growth of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of the recipient countries (at least those in Africa). Taking into account that the reconstruction of Western Europe thanks to the Marshall plan is not comparable, which country has achieved the status of a developed nation by means

of aid? During the years of the Cold War, aid has been provided for improper (political) reasons, sometimes propping up extremely corrupt regimes. The aid industry is well aware of its own interests and projects an arrogant image. Aid is often a transfer to the Government, and thereby not conducive to the development of a market economy. Compared to the creation of the right incentives, financial and other resources are of subordinate importance, and the transfer of resources creates an incentive to a dependent attitude which is an obstacle for self-reliance. And the inflow of financial resources leads to revaluation of the exchange rate which undermines the incentive for exporting. It also creates a potential for inflation and corruption.

The main merit of Dambisa Moyo is to have arranged these arguments in two groups: aid allegedly not bringing any benefit for the recipient country (Chapter 3), and on the other hand having great disadvantages (Chapter 4). A cost benefit analysis on this basis must necessarily lead to the abolition of aid. In fact, even with immediate effect. It

---

**Hundreds of billions of US dollars have been spent on development aid for Africa, but this has hardly resulted in growth of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of the recipient countries (at least those in Africa).**

---

is not obvious why Dr. Moyo still proposes a term of five years in order to phase out aid. Support has been expressed internationally (the *Financial Times* published a superficial interview, available at: [www.ft.com/cms/s/2/4121b1fa-ee5a-11dd-b791-0000779fd2ac.html](http://www.ft.com/cms/s/2/4121b1fa-ee5a-11dd-b791-0000779fd2ac.html)) and in Zambia (available at: [www.zambian-economist.com/2009/03/dead-aid-by-dambisa-moyo-review.html](http://www.zambian-economist.com/2009/03/dead-aid-by-dambisa-moyo-review.html)). Yet it is hard to find sound elements in Dr. Moyo's line of argument.

## ATTACKING THE CONCEPT OF AID

Moyo contrasts (like Max Weber in "Politics as Vocation", 1919) the ethics of good intentions or ethics of conscience, and the ethics of responsibility, which emphasise the actual achievement of good

---

**Aid expenditures for the benefit of health care, democratization and care of the environment are not made to promote economic growth, but because health and democracy are valuable in themselves.**

---

results. Whilst Weber recommends to combine the two (one wonders how good results will be achieved by people without good intentions), Dr. Moyo's Introduction and the section entitled "We Meant Well" (p. 28) unilaterally opt for the latter, rejecting the former. Those inspired by the parable of the good Samaritan (Luke 10) and others with good intentions may feel displeased by this antagonistic approach. It would better have been replaced by a discussion of the proper definition of criteria for success, and of the model to ensure that these results are achieved. For instance, when page xix promises "...a new model ... that offers economic growth, promises to significantly reduce African poverty, and *most importantly* does not rely on aid," it seems that the key priority is not economic growth and poverty reduction, but self-reliance at all costs.

It is definitely necessary to debate whether international strategies to promote development put the right emphasis on investment, trade and aid. Such a debate is not served but sidetracked by a frontal, generic attack on the principle of aid to those in need itself. This is not just in the context of the relationship between the countries of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and Africa or the LDCs, but in all social settings, even nations or more restricted social groupings concerned about the well-being of their least fortunate members and their own internal cohesion. That is what happens at page xviii in statements like:

"Deep in every liberal sensibility is a profound sense that in a world of moral uncertainty one idea is sacred, one belief cannot be compromised: the rich should help the poor, and the form of this help should be aid. The pop culture of aid has bolstered these misconceptions. .... We live in a culture of aid. We live in a culture in which those who are better off subscribe – both mentally and financially – to the motion that giving alms to the poor is the right thing to do."

Harvard professor Ferguson at page ix concurs and calls this a "widespread Western belief."

Apparently they are not satisfied with this aspect of Western culture and would like it to change. But the idea that "the rich should help the poor" is not just a *Western* belief. It is almost universally endorsed by all cultures (it is questionable if culture in the normative sense can exist in its absence). It is rooted in the world religions including Christianity, but also in the philosophy of social democracy. For instance, the norm that ODA should be at least 0.7% of the GDP of the donor country is a norm of the United Nations, OECD member states, the African Development Bank, Australia, New Zealand, Japan, Korea, China, India, and the member states of the Gulf Cooperation Council. The claim that "we live in a culture of aid" is unbalanced judging by the share of aid in GDP (0.3% in OECD countries, on average) as compared to the shares in GDP of consumption, investment and trade, all of which are driven by self-interest, not altruism.

## AID EFFECTIVENESS

Aid expenditures for the benefit of health care, democratisation and care of the environment are not made to promote economic growth, but because health and democracy are valuable in themselves. It is not reasonable to expect that such expenditures, via investments and export or through other channels, will lead to higher growth of GDP. They do lead to lower mortality figures for mothers and children and a higher life expectancy of people living with HIV and AIDS and others. Measured by these yardsticks, they are definitely successful. Expenditures for the benefit of education might, via

---

**They do lead to lower mortality figures for mothers and children and a higher life expectancy of people living with HIV and AIDS and others. Measured by these yardsticks, they are definitely successful.**

---

higher productiveness, innovation and foreign investments, lead to growth, but only with a lag of more than five years. And expenditures for emergency aid will take place when a country is afflicted by a disaster, and will therefore be negatively correlated with economic growth. For these three reasons it is not so surprising that econometric research carried out between 1995 and 2004 found little correlation between the total aid amounts and economic growth. Researchers Clemens et al. ([www.cgdev.org/content/publications/detail/2744](http://www.cgdev.org/content/publications/detail/2744)) in 2004 started to take these considerations into account and found that the remaining aid categories which could have a positive effect in the short term were budget and balance of payments support, infrastructure, support to agriculture and industry -- 53% of all aid flows in their data). These were indeed effective, with a rate of return of 13%.

Dr. Moyo, who at p. 46 maintains that "study after

study after study” has shown that allegedly aid has no impact on economic growth, shows no awareness of this development. She is therefore left with the so-called micro-macro-paradox that development aid at the level of projects is often demonstrably successful, from the construction of roads to the extinction of diseases. Her solution for this is to deny or ignore the evidence for success at the micro level.

Characteristic for abolitionism is the suggestion that hundreds of billions of US dollars spent on aid to Africa would be a big amount. Dr. Moyo says that 1 trillion of US dollars allegedly were involved (<http://online.wsj.com/article/SB123758895999200083.html>). But the authority on these statistics, the OECD's Development Assistance Committee (DAC) ([www.oecd.org/dac/stats](http://www.oecd.org/dac/stats)), reports a cumulative amount of Official Development Assistance (ODA) over the period 1960-2007 of 413.5 billion dollars. This is a discrepancy symptomatic for the way Dr.

---

**If it is made almost impossible to the private sector to pursue wealth creation, it is not realistic to expect from development aid that it will play the role of a growth engine (instead of a catalyst).**

---

Moyo uses her sources. This is less than Switzerland's GDP in a single year; clearly insufficient to have a decisive effect over 48 years on a population at least a hundred times larger. The fear of aid addiction on a continental scale is definitely overblown.

Has there ever been a country that achieved development with support of development aid? Yes, and even undisputedly, because it is Dr. Moyo herself who mentions that the United States between 1957 and 1990 gave as much aid to South Korea as to all of Africa (p. 45). Among others Taiwan, all new member states of the European Union joining in 2004 - 2007, and in Africa, Botswana, started prospering after and partly because of aid. This was accompanied by democratisation, something Dr. Moyo has reservations about. In all these cases, there were simultaneously drastic improvements in the investment climate. The World Bank's annual *Doing Business Survey* ([www.doingbusiness.org/CustomQuery/](http://www.doingbusiness.org/CustomQuery/)) shows how far Africa in this respect lags behind the rest of the world. This is in respect to the dozens of procedures and the hundreds of waiting days needed to start a company. There is also the construction licenses, rigidities concerning the employment of workers, the registration of property rights on immovable assets, the availability of credit, the protection of investors and the rule of law.

Dr. Moyo, who poses as a free market economist, does not make a single proposal for deregulation or

improvement in these areas, other than distorting the tax system by tax privileges (p. 102) in a brief and inadequate section on what a typical African country needs to do to attract Foreign Direct Investment. If it is made almost impossible to the private sector to pursue wealth creation, it is not realistic to expect from development aid that it will play the role of a growth engine (instead of a catalyst). Dr. Moyo's proposals exclusively concern the mobilisation of financial amounts for the benefit of Africa's development, and hardly the rate of return which can be achieved on capital invested under Africa's investment climate. However Africans themselves seem to be well aware of the problem that capital flight is enormous.

From independence till the middle of the 1980s, Africa was virtually a socialist continent. There was great waste and stagnation, documented in the case of Ghana, for example, by George Ayittey ([www.cato.org/pubs/journal/cj7n1/cj7n1-11.pdf](http://www.cato.org/pubs/journal/cj7n1/cj7n1-11.pdf)). Dr. Moyo ignores this, so that the stagnation in that period can be attributed to development aid and thereby to the West. The development business has gone through a development itself, as it has had to learn to help effectively and transparently. Innovations in the "aid industry" (departure from comprehensive Government planning and Cold War motives; local procurement wherever possible; ownership by the recipient partner; Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers) are however ignored. Thus the West looks like a stagnant monolith which never learns from its mistakes.

## NEGATIVE SIDE EFFECTS

Dr. Moyo fears that the appreciation of the exchange rate as a consequence of the inflow of aid moneys will have a negative effect on export. She even believes that this effect (which she calls "Dutch disease" instead of resource curse) in the 1960s "devastated the Dutch export sector and increased unemployment" (p. 63). Of course every inflow of foreign currency, irrespective whether it is foreign investment, exports themselves or aid, puts the exchange rate under upward pressure. But it would be absurd (and self-contradicting) to consider such an inflow for that reason as something negative. The main issue is that there will be an adjustment problem looming if the inflow originates from a source that is finite.

Dr. Moyo like other abolitionists erroneously supposes that development aid is synonymous to budget support such as has been given (but recently suspended) by the Dutch Government to Zambia's Ministry of Health. The only exception she admits is humanitarian aid, which she mainly excepts from criticism (p. 7) -- incidentally also an error. Terms such as "project aid" and "technical assistance" do not occur in her dictionary. She suggests that almost all development aid is transferred to recipient



governments. Due to supposed enormous lack of accountability this merely promotes corruption. She fails to indicate how that would improve if governments would get international commercial loans; she offers no proposals for the strengthening of Internal Audit Departments and Auditor-General's Offices. Most of her proposed alternatives for aid do not accrue at all to the main beneficiaries of aid: governments and NGOs.

## MANAGING AID, NOT ABOLISHING IT

Dr. Moyo's book rightly expresses the desire for self-reliance. But to seek this by first of all abolishing development aid would be putting the horse behind the cart. Development aid should be managed and optimised, not abolished. Botswana, which in testimony for the US Senate's Subcommittee on African Affairs from 1996 (available at: [www.cbo.gov/ftpdocs/47xx/doc4747/1996Doc11.pdf](http://www.cbo.gov/ftpdocs/47xx/doc4747/1996Doc11.pdf)) is compared to Zambia, offers an example:

Botswana and Zambia received comparable amounts of aid in the 1970s and 1980s if measured relative to the size of their economies. However, it appears that Botswana was able to use its foreign assistance more effectively to contribute to its investment needs as identified in its National Development Plan. That Plan serves as a guide for public expenditure and investment; it does not plan the economy or control the private sector. It also serves as an investment guide for donors, since any project that is financed must be in the plan and the recurrent costs must be incorporated into the budget. That practice ensures that donors are undertaking projects that are in the best interest of Botswana, as identified in the plan. Through the development plan, the Government in essence takes on the role of donor coordinator, thus giving it greater influence in designing and establishing the projects. The Government encourages individual donors to specialise in particular sectors of the economy. By focusing on certain areas, donors have been able to learn from their experiences, and the staff of the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning works with the same organizations from year to year."

Similarly, Botswana's former president Festus Mogae maintains (<http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/CPSI/UNPAN026975.pdf>):

[4] The Plans, coupled with transparency, accountability and commitment to abide by the Plans, helped Government to access significant levels of Official Development Assistance and technical assistance. In fact, in the early 1980s, Botswana was one of the largest aid recipients on a per capita basis among the developing countries. The generous technical assistance we received ... enabled us to make effective use, not only of the capital assistance at our disposal, but

---

**Dr. Moyo's book rightly expresses the desire for self-reliance. But to seek this by first of all abolishing development aid would be putting the horse behind the cart.**

---

also and above all, of our own financial resources when they became available as a result of mining activities. (...) [6] External borrowing was undertaken after careful assessment of projects to be financed as well as realistic assessment of ability to pay back. In addition, Botswana took advantage of concessionary international finance and resisted borrowing at high costs from private capital markets and multilateral development institutions.

Dr. Moyo deals with Botswana's case on the one hand categorically stating "...aid is not responsible for this achievement..." (p. 38), on the other hand claiming that Botswana has abandoned foreign aid and embraced the Dead Aid proposal (p. 144; 150). But in reality Botswana is still receiving technical assistance.

If aid will be proactively managed instead of abolished, and furthermore the investment climate in Africa would really be tackled, development aid to most African countries might indeed be abolished twenty or thirty years from now.

On 7 July 2009 Pope Benedict XVI in his encyclical *Caritas in Veritate* urged rich countries to allocate larger portions of their GDP to development aid to poor countries. Mercifully and wisely, he ignored Dr. Moyo's proposal in her book.

*Maarten de Zeeuw and Mwangala Mubita  
Rotterdam, The Netherlands*

**JCTR VISION:**  
"A society where faith promotes justice for all in all spheres of life, especially for the poor."

# LETTER TO THE EDITOR

## WHY CHRISTIANITY FAILS TO BE 24/7 RELIGION IN AFRICA

Dear Editor,

I found the article by Henry Makori, in the fourth quarter *Bulletin* of 2008, very thought provoking. I re-read the paragraph describing the different categories of people who occupy our Sunday morning pews (corrupt politicians and state officials, policemen who execute, rape suspects). I feel impelled to respond. While it is true that many of our politicians, policemen, etc., are honest and law abiding, we must strive to make Christianity a more deep-rooted reality in Africa. As well as describing the problems and the reasons, we need to go a step further to suggest some solutions

In one of the workshops which I attended many years ago, we were told, "Don't go to your boss or your superior with a problem unless you have thought it out and can suggest a solution." So, here is my suggestion.

For Christianity to be a "24/7 Religion" in Africa, we should begin in our own homes, especially with children when they are still very young. We should be models of honesty to them. Children are very observant and as the saying goes, "Actions will speak louder than words." They will learn best from our bad or good actions.

I know a lady who when she was five or six years old used to stuff some little toys into her pockets when shopping with her grandmother. When she would arrive home, she would display her loot to her mother. Being a wise woman, her mother would explain to her why it was wrong to get the toys without buying them from the shop and would make her go back to the shop, apologise and return the toys.

If children see their parents taking home items from their places of employment, e.g., pens, paper, office equipment or tools, with comments such as, "No one will miss these for they belong to the Government and we have the right to get them," they will subconsciously learn a bad lesson that using public goods for one's gain is fine.

Most of the corrupt politicians and civil servants are parents with children. What lessons are they conveying to their children and the youth of our society? Did they learn these corrupt traits from their parents? If they did, when will the cycle of corruption stop from parents to children? We could learn something from Scripture: "Train a child in the way he should grow, and when he is old he will not depart from it" (Proverbs 22:6), or "The one who is faithful in little things will be faithful in bigger things" (Luke 16:10).

The home and school must make concerted effort to model and teach honesty and truthfulness to children. Perhaps by the year 2050 or 2060, we will somehow be one of the most honest countries in the world. At present, our rating is somewhere in the lowest ten.

This is my suggestion on dealing with corruption and the pretense of being Christian when actually involving oneself in things that are bad. I believe that everything starts with a single step and each of us can do our share. It is my hope that if Christian values begin in the family with very young children, our relationship with Christ will be more than just a Sunday morning affair – it will be a normal part and parcel of our African spirituality for twenty-four hours a day, seven days a week.

Mary M. O'Grady, S.H.SP.  
Mongu, Zambia

### JCTR MISSION:

The mission of the Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR), a project of the Zambia-Malawi Province of the Society of Jesus (Jesuit Order), is to foster from a faith-inspired perspective a critical understanding of current issues. Guided by the Church's social teaching that emphasises human dignity in community, our mission is to generate activities for the promotion of the fullness of human life through research, education, advocacy and consultation. Cooperating widely with other groups, we aim to promote an inculturated faith, gender equality, and empowerment of local communities in the work of justice and peace and the integrity of creation.

# THE JCTR BASIC NEEDS BASKET

The Social Conditions Programme of the JCTR conducts monthly research on the cost of basic needs within a number of urban areas across Zambia, including Lusaka, Ndola, Kitwe, Luanshya, Kabwe, Livingstone, Mongu and Kasama. Recently the Programme has embarked on research in rural areas; Malama in Eastern Province, Mumfumbwe in North Western Province and Masaiti in Copperbelt Province. For the month of July 2009, the cost of Basic Needs Basket stood at K2,226,930 in Lusaka; K1,734,094 in Ndola, K1,351,892 in Kasama, K1,512,892 in Kabwe, K1,442,811 in Mongu and K1,940,581 in Livingstone.

## (A) COST OF BASIC FOOD ITEMS FOR A FAMILY OF SIX IN LUSAKA

| Commodity               | Kwacha | Quantity       | Total            |
|-------------------------|--------|----------------|------------------|
| Mealie meal (breakfast) | 63,000 | 3 x 25 Kg bags | 189,000          |
| Beans                   | 9,100  | 2 Kgs          | 18,200           |
| Kapenta (Siavonga)      | 44,300 | 2 Kgs          | 88,600           |
| Dry Fish                | 60,000 | 1 Kg           | 60,000           |
| Meat (mixed cut)        | 18,100 | 4 Kgs          | 72,400           |
| Eggs                    | 7,600  | 2 Units        | 15,200           |
| Vegetables (greens)     | 6,000  | 7.5 Kgs        | 45,000           |
| Tomato                  | 8,000  | 4 Kgs          | 32,000           |
| Onion                   | 7,600  | 4 Kgs          | 30,400           |
| Milk (fresh)            | 11,000 | 1 x 2 litres   | 11,000           |
| Cooking oil             | 27,900 | 2 x 2 litres   | 55,800           |
| Bread                   | 3,700  | 1 loaf/day     | 111,000          |
| Sugar                   | 5,400  | 8 Kgs          | 43,200           |
| Salt                    | 2,100  | 1 Kg           | 2,100            |
| Tea (leaves)            | 10,700 | 1 x 500 g      | 10,700           |
| <b>Sub-total</b>        |        |                | <b>K784, 500</b> |

## (B) COST OF ESSENTIAL NON-FOOD ITEMS

|                                     |           |                |                    |
|-------------------------------------|-----------|----------------|--------------------|
| Charcoal                            | 61,700    | 2 x 90 Kg bags | 123,400            |
| Soap (Lifebuoy)                     | 2,500     | 10 tablets     | 25,000             |
| Wash soap (Boom)                    | 4,400     | 4 x 400 g      | 17,600             |
| Jelly (e.g., Vaseline)              | 8,800     | 1 x 500 ml     | 8,800              |
| Electricity (medium density)        | 53,000    | 300 units      | 53,000             |
| Water & Sanitation (med - fixed)    | 114,530   | 114,530        |                    |
| Housing (medium density)            | 1,100,000 | 1,100,000      |                    |
| <b>Sub-total</b>                    |           |                | <b>K1, 442,330</b> |
| <b>Total for Basic Needs Basket</b> |           |                | <b>K2, 226,930</b> |

| Totals from previous months | Jul 08    | Aug 08    | Sep 08    | Oct 08    | Nov 08    | Dec 08    | Jan 09    | Feb 09    | Mar 09    | Apr 09    | May 09    | Jun 09    |
|-----------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| <b>Amount</b>               | 1,893,150 | 1,834,100 | 1,828,100 | 1,854,850 | 1,914,450 | 1,934,950 | 2,186,980 | 2,199,880 | 2,213,930 | 2,219,230 | 2,240,280 | 2,168,730 |

## (C) SOME OTHER ADDITIONAL COSTS

| Item                         | Kwacha                  | Item                             | Kwacha  |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------|---------|
| Education                    |                         | Transport (bus fare round trip): |         |
| Grades 8-9 (User+PTA/year)   | K300,000 – K420,000     | Chilenje-Town                    | K5,600  |
| Grades 10-12 (User+PTA/year) | K500,000 – K720,000     | Chelston-Town                    | K6,800  |
| School Uniform (grades 8-12) | K90,000 – K180,000      | Matero-Town                      | K5,000  |
| Health (clinic)              | Fuel (cost at the pump) |                                  |         |
| 3 Month Scheme (per person)  | K5, 000                 | Petrol (per litre)               | K5, 818 |
| No Scheme Emergency Fee      | K5, 500                 | Diesel (per litre)               | K5, 417 |
| Mosquito Net (private)       | K15, 000 – K20, 000     | Paraffin (per litre)             |         |

## (D) SOME COMPARATIVE FIGURES OF WAGES--"TAKE HOME PAY"

|                 | Teacher                  | Nurse                    | Guard with Security Firm | Secretary in Civil Service | Average Monthly Income in Urban Low-Cost Area - CSO | Pieceworker on a Farm     |
|-----------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------------|---|---------------------------|
| <b>Pay Slip</b> | K1,145,300 to K1,631,600 | K1,121,000 to K2,624,000 | K300,000 to K750,000     | K915,000 to K1,480,000     | 645,326 (between October 2004 and January 2005)     | K3,000 to K15,000 per day |

The July Basic Needs Basket is approximately **US\$438** based upon an average middle exchange rate of 5080 Kwacha per US\$ at the end of July

# THE JCTR UPDATE: PEOPLE AND ACTIVITIES

WHAT KEEPS US BUSY AT THE JCTR? HERE ARE SOME RECENT ITEMS OF INTEREST

## CHURCH SOCIAL TEACHING PROGRAMME

From April to June, one of the major activities we focused on was the preparation of the 2010 Church Social Teaching calendar. The main theme is "Political Responsibility" with monthly themes including Leadership, Vocation and Politics, Youth and Governance, Church and State, and the Poor and Politics. The Calendar raises critical and interesting issues on "Political Responsibility" that need discussion in our communities.

The Programme continues to sensitise different groups on the African Peer Review Mechanism (APRM) and on Human Rights, especially on the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ESCR) which need to be included in the Bill of Rights of the Zambian Constitution. Many ESCRs in the Mung'omba Draft Constitution have been recommended by the Human Rights Committee of the National Constitutional Conference (NCC). We advocate that the NCC Plenary adopts these important rights.

Preparations for participation in the Second African Synod are underway. The Synod takes place in October 2009 in Rome.

In May, Dominic Liche attended the "Fundamentals in Social Accountability Monitoring" course at the Centre for Social Accountability (CSA) in South Africa. The course is centred on the idea that citizens have the right to demand explanations and justifications for use of public resources.

## SOCIAL CONDITIONS PROGRAMME

The Programme continues to conduct living conditions surveys through its Urban and Rural Baskets, and uses the findings for advocacy.

After a rigorous five (5) months pilot period in each town, the Programme launched the Monze and Solwezi *Basic Needs Baskets* (BNB) on 11 June and 01 July respectively. The launch marked the beginning of public distribution of the BNBs. The inclusion of the two towns on the BNB grid was for strategic purposes. Monze will facilitate understanding of the cost of living in a transit town with limited economic activity while the influence of an economic boom on the cost of living will be better understood in Solwezi, one of the current hives of copper production. It is the Programmes' hope that the BNBs in these towns will strengthen advocacy efforts for like-minded groups.

The Rural Basket, an innovative tool that tracks rural development in select rural areas in Zambia, has quickly risen to prominence. The programme made a *Rural Basket* presentation at the Poverty

Reduction Budget Support (PRBS) meeting, which was held on 22 June 2009. The focus of the presentation was on assessing rural service delivery using the findings from the Rural Basket.

## OUTREACH PROGRAMME

To enhance people's participation in monitoring use of public resources, JCTR Outreach teams held public forums, workshops and meetings in Kasama, Kabwe, Mongu, and Monze on the 2009 national budget and the JCTR proposed debt management bill.

A meeting to disseminate research findings on constraints facing informal cross border traders was held in April in Kazungula. Participants resolved to strengthen operations of the Cross-border Trade Association.

Three meetings on the Basic Needs Basket were held in Livingstone and Kasama. Public forums in May were held in Monze and Mongu to commemorate the World Debt Day.

## DEBT, AID AND TRADE PROGRAMME

The main preoccupation for the Programme in the second quarter was the study on fisheries that was commissioned earlier in the year. The findings will soon be launched and disseminated.

Tina Nanyangwe-Moyo organised a meeting with Cooperating Partners, Government and the Civil Society on the Accra Agenda for Action. The meeting was aimed at evaluating the local measures at improving aid effectiveness and to listen to all the stakeholders' experiences of these local mechanisms.

In June, Humphrey Mulemba attended two separate meetings on debt campaign and responsible lending in Rome and in Barcelona respectively. A month earlier, Privilege Haang'andu attended a meeting on the effects of the global economic crisis on low income countries in Malaysia.

## INFORMATION OFFICE

The JCTR and Alliance Francais public lecture was held on 03 June 2009 at Alliance Francais in Lusaka. The presentation, entitled "Is Religion a Hindrance or a Help to Development?", was given by JCTR Director, Pete Henriot, and Prof. Seshamani from the University of Zambia responded to the paper.

## THANK YOU

JCTR would like to thank Ms. Jackie Sokoni for recently working with the Information Officer in our Resource Centre.

Views expressed in the JCTR *Bulletin* do not necessarily reflect the views of the JCTR.



**Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR)**

**JCTR Repository**

**<https://repository.jctr.org.zm>**

---

Bulletin

Advocacy on Debt

---

2009

# JCTR Bulletin 2nd Quarter 2009

**Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection**

Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection

---

<https://repository.jctr.org.zm/handle/20.500.14274/25>

*Downloaded from JCTR Repository, Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR)*